## 1 Europe's adaptation to the energy crisis: Reshaped gas supply-

# transmission-consumption structures and driving factors from 2022 to 2024

Chuanlong Zhou<sup>1</sup>, Biqing Zhu<sup>1</sup>, Antoine Halff<sup>2,5</sup>, Steven J. Davis<sup>3</sup>, Zhu Liu<sup>4</sup>, Simon Bowring<sup>1</sup>, Simon Ben
 Arous<sup>5</sup>, Philippe Ciais<sup>1,\*</sup>

- 6 <sup>1</sup>Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement, CEA CNRS UVSQ, 91190, France
- 7 <sup>2</sup>SIPA Center on Global Energy Policy, Columbia University, New York, NY 10027, USA
- 8 <sup>3</sup> Department of Earth System Science, University of California Irvine, Irvine, CA 92697, USA
- <sup>4</sup> Department of Earth System Science, Tsinghua University, Beijing, 100190, China
- <sup>5</sup> Kayrros Inc., Paris, 75009, France
- 11 Correspondence to: Philippe Ciais. (philippe.ciais@lsce.ipsl.fr)
- 12 Keywords: natural gas, EU energy crisis, supply-transmission-consumption analysis, LNG
- 13 Abstract. The 2022 invasion of Ukraine by Russia triggered a significant energy crisis in the EU27&UK, leading to
- 14 profound changes in their natural gas supply, transmission, and consumption dynamics. To analyze those pattern
- 15 shifts, we first update our natural gas supply dataset, EUGasSC, with daily country- and sector-specific supply
- sources. We then provide a newly constructed daily intra-EU natural gas transmission dataset, EUGasNet, with
- 17 specified supply sources utilizing the ENTSOG (European Network of Transmission System Operators for Gas) and
- 18 EUGasSC data. To further understand the economic and climatic impacts, we finally developed EUGasImpact, a
- 19 daily dataset with sector-specific driving factors of consumption changes based on change attribution models using
- 20 multiple open datasets. Those datasets are available on the Zenodo platform:
- 21 <u>https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.11175364</u> (Zhou et al., 2024). On the supply side, Russian gas supply to the
- EU27&UK was cut by 87.8% (976.8 TWh per winter) during the post-invasion winters compared to the previous
- 23 winters. LNG imports become the largest gas supply source, rising from 20.7% to 37.5% of the total gas supply. Our
- 24 intra-EU gas transmission analysis showed the gas transmission network was adjusted to mitigate the large gas
- shortfalls in Germany and distribute LNG arrivals. Total gas consumption fell by **19.0%**, which was driven by 1)
- consumer behavioral changes in household heating (contributed to **29%** of the total reduction, the same for the
- 27 following numbers), 2) drops in industrial production (25%), 3) heating drops due to the warmer winter
- temperatures (11%), 4) shifts towards renewable electricity including wind, solar, and hydro (10%), 5) decline in
- 29 gas-powered electricity generation (9%), 6) adoptions of energy-efficient heat pumps for industrial gas heating
- 30 (4%), 7) shifts towards non-renewable electricity including coal, oil, and nuclear (1%), and 8) other unmodeled
- 31 factors (11%). We evaluated the benefits and costs associated with these pattern changes and discussed whether
- 32 these changes would potentially lead to long-term structural changes in the EU energy dynamics. Our datasets and
- 33 these insights can provide valuable perspectives for understanding the consequences of this energy crisis and the
- 34 challenges to future energy security in the EU.

#### 35 1.Introduction

- 36 The European Union faced an energy crisis triggered by the Russian invasion of Ukraine in 2022, which led to a
- 37 sudden halt of natural gas supplies from Russia, the EU's largest gas supplier (Kardaś, 2023). In the year prior, 2021,
- **38** Russia exported 155 bcm of natural gas  $(1.6 \times 10^3 \text{ TWh})$ , accounting for 45% of the total EU gas imports (Eurostat,
- 39 2023 a). The subsequent winters of this crisis presented crucial tests for the EU's ability to manage the disruption in
- 40 Russian pipeline gas imports (Prince et al., 2023), especially considering the high heating demand in the cold seasons
- 41 and the unexpected energy supply shortfalls (Zhou et al., 2023).
- Prior studies have suggested multiple strategies to mitigate the energy crisis: 1) on the supply side, increasing gas
   imports from alternative suppliers, including additional imports from LNG and existing pipelines from Northern
- 44 Africa and Middle East (McWilliams et al., 2023) (Castellano et al., 2023), 2) in terms of gas transmission, enhancing
- 45 the intra-EU gas redistribution to balance the supply and demand among member states (Zhou et al., 2023), 3) on the
- 46 consumption side, reducing gas demand, such as energy conservation, scaling down industrial production (IEA, 2023,
- 47 a) (Zeniewski et al., 2023), 4) regarding the energy structure, diversifying energy sources from gas, for instance,
- 48 increasing the number of heat pumps, and switching to non-gas-powered electricity (Kardaś, 2023) (Hockenos, 2023).
- 49 However, there is a pressing need for detailed, high-resolution data to quantify the significance of those pathways in
- 50 structural supply-transmission-consumption pattern changes and their economic-climatic impacts after the energy
- 51 crisis. Additionally, quantitative assessment of intra-EU gas redirection in mitigating the crisis remains unclear,
- 52 particularly since there were transmission "bottlenecks" in the intra-EU gas transmission net (Zhou et al., 2023)
- **53** (ENTSOG, 2020).
- 54 To address these needs, we developed comprehensive datasets for supply, transmission, and consumption at daily 55 resolution, respectively. On the supply side, we updated our EU natural gas dataset, EUGasSC (Zhou et al., 2023), 56 which provides the country- and sector-specific gas supply patterns. For analyzing intra-EU gas redirection, we 57 provide a newly constructed intra-EU gas transmission net dataset, EUGasNet, utilizing the ENTSOG (European 58 Network of Transmission System Operators for Gas) (ENTSOG, 2023) and EUGasSC data. To quantify the driving 59 factors in the heating, power, and industrial sectors, we developed EUGasImpact using sectoral-specific change 60 attribution models and multiple open datasets, which enables the factor analysis and impact analysis of consumption 61 changes across these sectors.
- 62 For the heating sector, we differentiated the consumption changes with the contribution of consumers' behavioral 63 changes and anomalously warm winter temperatures (Abnett, 2023) based on a behavior-climate attribution model 64 utilizing temperature-consumption curves (Zhou et al., 2023) and ERA5-land temperature data (Hersbach et al., n.d.). 65 For the power sector, we assessed whether the consumption reduction in gas-powered electricity generation could be 66 offset by the increments of electricity generation from alternative energy sources. This evaluation was conducted 67 through an explainable-reduction attribution model with day-to-day change comparisons, utilizing both gas 68 consumption and electricity generation data from the Carbon Monitor power dataset (Zhu et al., 2023). For the 69 industrial sector, we assume the consumption reduction due to the substitution of gas heating with electrically powered 70 heat pumps is unlikely to lead to declines in industrial production (Castellano et al., 2023). Similar day-to-day change

- comparison approach is performed to assess whether the industrial consumption reduction could be explained by the
   increments of total electricity generation with a gas-to-electricity conversion efficiency.
- 73 We provide three datasets, EUGasSC, EUGasNet, and EUGasImpact, which provide daily gas supply, transmission,
- 74 and consumption dynamics with country- and sector-specific data. Using these datasets, we conducted comprehensive
- 75 analyses of how EU states adapted to the energy crisis triggered by the invasion. The EUGasSC dataset illustrates how
- 76 LNG imports replaced Russian pipeline imports and become the largest gas supply source to the EU. With EUGasNet,
- 77 we found intra-EU gas transmission network shows enhanced "redirection" flows towards the western states,
- 78 especially to Germany, which faced the most acute gas shortage. According to EUGasImpact, we quantified the
- 79 contributions of driving factors to the significant net gas consumption reduction during the post-invasion winters, such
- 80 as heating reduction, energy structure shifting, structural dependency reduction of gas use, and declines in electricity
- 81 generation and industrial production. We further discussed the economic and climatic consequences of those shifts
- 82 found from the three datasets, as well as whether those facets would lead to structural transformations in long-term
- 83 energy security within the EU regions, regarding the uncertainties associated with the global LNG market, the intra-
- 84 EU transmission "bottleneck" in the EU gas network, potential impact to residential living costs, and the ongoing
- 85 transition towards greener energy sources.

#### 86 2.Methods

#### 87 2.1.Data collection

- 88 The workflow of this study is shown in Fig 1. On the supply side, we collected the EUGasSC dataset that provides the
- daily country- and sector-specific gas supply data (Zhou et al., 2023). For the analysis of intra-EU gas transmission,
- 90 we gathered the daily natural gas transmission (pipeline) and import data (both pipeline and LNG imports) for the
- 91 EU27&UK from ENTSOG (ENTSOG, 2023), and used EUGasSC for specifying the supply sources.
- 92 The ERA5-land temperature (Hersbach et al., n.d.) was collected and used to fit the empirical temperature-gas-
- 93 consumption (TGC) curves to estimate the gas consumption changes in the heating sector (Zhou et al., 2023) (Ciais
- 94 et al., 2022). The country-based daily power generation data with specified energy sources, including gas, coal, oil,
- 95 nuclear, wind, solar, hydro, and other renewables, were collected from the Carbon Monitor power dataset (Zhu et al.,96 2023).
- 97 The Dutch Title Transfer Facility (TTF) natural gas prices from 2019 to 2024 were collected and used as the overall
  98 natural gas price index in EU27&UK (Dutch TTF Natural Gas Futures, 2023). The household energy price index
- 99 (HEPI) and the gas and electricity prices in the capital cities of EU27&UK were used for the analysis of economic
- 100 impacts on household gas consumption (Household Energy Price Index, 2023).

#### 101 2.2.Periods of analysis

102 The "winter" in this study refers to the major heating months that are associated with an elevated risk due to the energy

- 103 shortage. Therefore, "winter" is defined to include the months of November, December, January, February, and March.
- 104 These months use gas intensively as a major heating fuel (contributing from 54.3% to 58.8% of annual gas

- 105 consumption) in the EU countries (Zhou et al., 2023). Accordingly, we define the post-invasion winters as November
- 106 2022 to March 2023 for the winter of 2022-2023, and November 2023 to March 2024 for the winter of 2023-2024.
- 107 For comparative analysis, we refer to the three pre-invasion winters of 2019-2020, 2020-2021, and 2021-2022, using
- 108 the same seasonal timeframe.
- 109 However, our study encompasses an annual perspective for analyzing the net intra-EU gas transmission. The intra-EU
- 110 gas transmission in the non-heating seasons can also be important as they may indicate the variations and
- redistributions of gas storage within the EU (Zhou et al., 2023). Therefore, the pre-invasion period is defined from
- 112 2019-04-01 to 2022-03-31 (three years), and the post-invasion period is defined from 2022-04-01 to 2024-03-31, as
- illustrated in Fig 3.

#### 114 2.3.EU gas supply (EUGasSC)

115 For the supply side, we updated our EU natural gas dataset, EUGasSC, extending its coverage until 2024-03-31. The 116 EUGasSC dataset has been described in our previous work (Zhou et al., 2023) and briefly introduced in the 117 supplementary. The EUGasSC dataset provides the daily country- and sector-specific gas supply based on a mass flow 118 balance simulation model. We then estimated changes in gas supply sources, including Russian imports, LNG imports, 119 other pipeline imports, and EU local productions based on the EUGasSC dataset. We observed a supply shortfall, the 120 "Russian gas gap", for post-invasion winters due to the inability to boost non-Russian gas supplies to offset the 121 reduction in Russian gas supply. However, this gap in gas supply did not necessarily translate into a "shortage". This 122 supply-consumption dynamic analysis will be discussed below in section 2.5. 123 Note that the gas supply discussed in this paper refers to the original supply source estimated in EUGasSC dataset

- 124 (see method). For example, Germany may receive LNG gas supplies even though there are no LNG terminals in
- 125 Germany before Dec. 2022 (Waldholz et al., 2023).

#### 126 2.4.Intra-EU gas transmission (EUGasNet)

- 127 To understand the changes in the intra-EU gas transmission in response to the energy crisis, we analyzed the net flow
- 128 changes in the gas transmission network between the pre-invasion and post-invasion periods. To perform the net flow
- 129 change analysis, we first constructed the gas transmission network graphs by integrating the physical flows, import
- 130 volumes from ENTSOG, and supply source from EUGasSC for both pre-invasion and post-invasion periods (Fig S7
- b and c). Then we access the the bidirectional flow differences between the annual average transmission values of the
- 132 pre- and post-invasion periods (Fig S7 a). Finally, we computed the net flow changes by accumulating the bidirectional
- 133 flow differences. The detailed equations are presented in the supplementary.
- This net flow change analysis allows us to understand the shifts in significance of both countries (nodes) and their interconnections (edges) in the intra-EU gas transmission network, as shown in Fig 3. The nodes are color-coded to represent countries experiencing either an increase (in green) or a decrease (in red) in outgoing gas transmission relative to the pre-invasion period. The direction and net flow change (edges between countries) are only meaningful if analyzed together. For example, a positive edge connected from France to Germany indicates an increased net flow
- 139 from France to Germany relative to the pre-invasion period (Fig S8), and this is equivalent to a negative edge from

- 140 Germany to France. The edge directions in our analysis (Fig 3) are defined based on the flow patterns observed in the
- 141 pre-invasion network. Therefore, the red edges in Fig 3 indicate reversed transmission directions between the two
- 142 countries during the post-invasion periods.

#### 143 2.5.Consumption changes (EUGasImpact)

144 The EU27&UK responded to the "Russian gas gap" during the post-invasion winters by diversifying gas supplies, 145 conserving usage, and reducing structural gas dependency. To further understand those dynamics and their impacts,

- 146 we developed consumption reduction attribution models for residential heating, power, and industrial sectors (Fig 1).
- 147 EUGasImpact is then constructed based on the output of these reduction attribution models at daily resolution. The
- 148 detailed model equations for all the sectors discussed below are presented in the supplementary.

#### 149 2.5.1.Residential heating sector

150 In the residential heating sector, we assess the impact of heating behavioral changes and climate change based on the 151 behavior-climate attribution model (Fig 1). This approach utilized the empirical Temperature-Gas Consumption 152 (TGC) curves, which illustrate how heating consumption varies with changes in ambient temperature (Zhou et al., 153 2023) (Mittakola et al., 2024). We used Temperature-Gas Consumption (TGC) curves instead of Heating Degree Day 154 (HDD) models, which are widely used in energy modeling, because TGC curves not only effectively model gas 155 consumption during winter but also capture shifts in heating behavior between pre- and post-invasion winters. Unlike 156 HDD models, which rely on a fixed base temperature, TGC curves account for changes in heating patterns, reflecting 157 the observed reduction in heating demand at the same ambient temperatures during the energy crisis, as shown in Fig. 158 S9. The gas consumption change due to the behavioral shifts can be estimated by calculating the differences in 159 consumptions at post-invasion temperatures using both pre-invasion and post-invasion TGC curves. Similarly, gas 160 consumption changes due to temperature variations can be estimated by computing the differences in consumption 161 under pre-invasion and post-invasion temperatures using the post-invasion TGC curves.

#### 162 2.5.2.Power sector

163 In the power sector, we assess whether the reduction in gas consumption for electricity generation can be offset by 164 alternative sources (if exist), or lead to a net decrease in electricity supply based on the explainable-reduction 165 attribution model (Fig 1). We assume that any reduction in gas-powered electricity could be compensated by increased 166 electricity generation from coal, oil, nuclear, wind, solar, hydro, and other forms. Conversely, an inability to fill the 167 reduction in gas-powered electricity might suggest a potential shortage in the overall electricity supply. To better 168 understand the substitution of renewable energy, we analyze Pearson's correlation coefficient (r) between the increase 169 in renewable power generation and the reduction in gas-powered electricity, with statistical significance set at p < p170 0.05. To smooth out weekly variations, we utilized 7-day aggregated data for day-to-day comparisons of all energy 171 sources during both the pre- and post-invasion winters.

#### 172 2.5.3.Industrial sector

- 173 In the industrial sector, gas consumption can be differentiated between gas consumption for energy use, such as heating
- and electricity generation, and non-energy use, like chemical feedstocks or raw materials (Eurostat, 2023 b) (Energy
- 175 Statistics, 2023). Gas consumption reduction resulting from the adoption of heat pumps is unlikely to negatively
- 176 impact industrial production, whereas reductions in non-energy gas use may indicate a decline in industrial output
- 177 (Castellano et al., 2023) (McWilliams et al., 2023).
- 178 Like the power sector, we evaluate the potential impact of reduced gas consumption on industrial production using
- the explainable-reduction attribution model (Fig 1) and 7-day aggregated comparisons. We assume that any increase
- 180 in electricity generation is primarily due to heightened heat pump usage in industry, resulting in lower gas consumption
- 181 for energy use. In the industrial sector, we examined whether the increase in electricity generation could offset the
- 182 reduction in industrial gas consumption for heating (electricity-to-gas comparison). Since electricity and gas are not
- 183 directly interchangeable, we applied a gas-to-electricity conversion efficiency to estimate the potential replacement
- 184 effect. A decrease in industrial gas consumption is unlikely to negatively affect industrial production if the increase in
- 185 electricity generation (if present) is sufficient to compensate for the reduced gas use, considering a specific gas-to-
- 186 electricity conversion efficiency (concept illustrated in Fig S16). Our assumption and analysis might overestimate the
- 187 impact of gas shortages on industrial production (see Uncertainty section below).

#### **188 3.Uncertainties and bias**

- 189 In the residential heating sector, uncertainties are relatively low as TGC curves can effectively capture the gas 190 consumption based on temperature (Fig S9,  $r^2 = 0.55 \pm 0.21$ ). The estimated consumption changes (*change*<sub>behavior.date</sub>) 191 +  $change_{temperature,date}$ ) account for 94±13% of the actual changes (  $consumption_{pre date}$  -192 consumption<sub>post\_date</sub>). This low model uncertainty also underpins the precise predictions of gas conservation in our 193 previous study, with only a slight overestimation of 5% (Fig 6, right panel) (Zhou et al., 2023). All values expressed 194 as  $\pm$  in this paper represent standard deviations (SD). In this study, we report values with three significant figures 195 when they are directly calculated from raw data, whereas values derived from modeling outputs are rounded to two 196 significant figures to better reflect their associated uncertainties.
- 197 In the power and industrial sectors, our attribution model assumed constant total power generation volumes and 198 electricity demands during the pre- and post-invasion winters. The differences in total power generation between pre-199 and post-invasion winters were relatively small (-0.4±0.6%) across the EU27&UK. However, assuming unchanged 200 electricity demand overlooks demand variations driven by rising electricity prices and energy conservation measures 201 across the EU (Askew, 2023) (Hockenos, 2023). This could lead to an overestimation of "negative impacts," as some 202 observed reductions may stem from lower demand rather than actual supply constraints. Another limitation of our 203 approach is that we did not account for cross-border electricity transmission within the EU, which could have played 204 a role in balancing supply and demand at the national level. As a result, our analysis might depict the "maximum" 205 potential negative impacts of gas reductions on the power and industrial sectors.

206 In the industrial sector, our simplified assumption does not account for the substitution of gas with other fossil fuels 207 as energy source, such as oil or coal, due to the lack of reliable data, even though these fuels were widely used by 208 industries during the energy crisis to avoid disruptions. Additionally, many industrial processes require high 209 temperatures that heat pumps alone cannot provide. As a result, our analysis likely overestimates the impact of the gas 210 crisis on industrial production. However, it serves as a worst-case scenario, providing an upper-bound estimate of 211 potential industrial production losses without considering alternative fossil fuels (e.g., oil or coal) and relying solely 212 on electricity, which implies the additional electricity demand required for industrial electrification in the transition to 213 greener energy sources.

#### 214 4.Results

#### 215 4.1.Overview of gas supply and consumption

216 During the post-invasion winters, the natural gas supply structure to EU27&UK was profoundly reshaped (Fig 2 and 217 Fig S1). The share of EU gas supply from Russia, the previous largest supplier, plummeted from 36.3% to 5.4%, 218 creating a shortfall of 1953.6 TWh together for the two winters. Despite this dramatic reduction, Russia continued to 219 provide a considerable volume of gas (257.3 TWh) to EU27&UK during the post-invasion winters through the ongoing 220 transmissions to Slovakia, Lithuania, Poland, and Hungary (Table S1), and the non-winter gas storage (12.9 TWh, Fig 221 S4). The supply gap from Russia was filled by 43.5% in the two post-invasion winters, primarily through the increased 222 LNG imports (593.3 TWh), and scaling up pipeline throughput from Norway and Serbia (176.9 TWh), Libya and 223 Algeria (79.9 TWh). Conversely, gas supplies from Middle Eastern countries (Turkey and Azerbaijan) and EU 224 production decreased by 13.2 TWh and 45.4 TWh, respectively, during the post-invasion winters. The remaining 225 Russian gas supply gap, combined with the other supply drops, led to a substantial reduction in gas consumption 226 during the post-invasion winters, amounting to 1162.0 TWh.

- 227 We observed a uniform decrease in gas consumption (25.5±16.0%, SD for countries) across all EU countries
- regardless of their varying levels of reliance on Russian gas for the two post-invasion winters. In Western EU countries
- (Fig 6 and Fig S3), where the gas supply sources remained robust, consumption reductions surpassed the decline in
- the Russian gas supply. This suggests that demand-side factors, such as higher gas prices or a shift away from structural
- dependence on gas (Zeniewski et al., 2023), were likely the primary drivers behind these reductions. In contrast, in
- other EU countries (Fig 6 and Fig S3), the gaps in Russian gas supply were greater than the reductions in consumption,
- 233 indicating that supply-side constraints, such as the lack of sufficient alternative gas sources to compensate for the
- reduced Russian supplies, played a more significant role in their consumption reductions.

#### 235 4.2.Changes in intra-EU gas transmission

236 Following the Russian invasion of Ukraine, significant changes occurred in intra-EU gas transmissions (Fig 3 and Fig

- 237 S7). During the pre-invasion period, the dominant gas transmission direction was from East-Central Europe toward
- 238 Western Europe. However, these flows experienced sharp declines in both cross-border flows (red lines in the network,
- Fig 3) and total country outflow (red circles in the network, Fig 3), primarily due to a substantial reduction of Russian

240 gas exports to the EU (-2427.5 TWh annually). In response, gas transmission in the reverse direction increased,

- 241 compensating for reduced Russian supply—for example, gas flows from Spain-France to Germany (Fig. 3, green lines
- and circles). Our flow change analysis (Fig 3, S1, S7, and S8) was conducted over a one-year duration to fully account
- for the transient seasonal flows related to storage changes (see methods).
- 244 Two critical pathways showing reduced net Russian gas transmission are evident in the network (Fig 3, marked in 245 red): 1) from Russia, Slovakia, and Austria, to Italy, and 2) from Russia, Poland, to Germany. Notably, a larger 246 negative net flow from Poland to Germany (-520 TWh per year) compared to Russia to Poland (-373 TWh per year) 247 appears counterintuitive. The reason for this is the shift in the initial net flow direction: prior to the invasion, gas 248 flowed from Poland to Germany; but during the post-invasion period, Germany reversed the flow, sending back part 249 of its gas imports from Western countries to Poland (Fig S8). To compensate for the reduced Russian supply at the 250 EU scale, the major LNG importing countries, including Spain, the UK, Portugal, the Netherlands, France, and 251 Belgium-Luxembourg, significantly increased their LNG transmission over consumption ratio from 0.36 to 1.08 252 (Table S2), indicating that a greater portion of the LNG imported by these countries was redirected to others with
- larger gas deficits.

#### 254 4.3.Consumption reductions and attributions

- 255 The sectoral gas consumption reductions per winter are ranked in decreasing order as follows: residential sector (208.5 256 TWh, accounting for 14.1% of the sector) > industrial sector (153.3 TWh, 27.5% of the sector) > power sector (108.6 257 TWh, 19.5% of the sector). However, these reductions in consumption do not necessarily equate to gas shortages in 258 EU countries, as various responses can either reduce the gas demand or structural gas dependency (Kardaś, 2023) 259 (Castellano et al., 2023) (IEA, 2023, a). Based on our reduction attribution models (Fig 4 to 5), we attributed the gas 260 consumption reductions to the following factors: 1) behavioral/structural change (44%), which includes decreased 261 household heating consumption (29%), increased electricity supply from alternative energy sources (coal, nuclear, 262 wind, solar, and hydro, 11%), and the adoption of heat pumps in the industry (4%), 2) gas shortage (34%), including
- declines in electricity generation (9%) and industrial production (25%), and 3) other factors (22%), such as reduced
- heating demand due to warmer temperatures (11%), and changes in unmodeled consumptions (11%).

#### 265 4.3.1.Residential heating sector

- 266 We first examined the consumption reduction in the residential heating sector as gas is mainly used for heating 267  $(46.2\pm18.0\%)$  of total consumption for the post-invasion periods). Our findings reveal that, in the post-invasion winters, 268 the majority of EU27&UK countries reduced their consumption in both household and public heating, ranging from -269 0.5% to -59.3% compared with pre-invasion winters with exceptions in Poland and Finland with increased 270 consumptions. Italy experienced the largest absolute consumption reduction in the heating sector (35.6 TWh, 271 accounting for 16.7% of its consumption), followed by Germany (35.3 TWh, -13.6%), the UK (30.4 TWh, -11.2%), 272 France (28.7 TWh, -16.7%), and Hungary (26.8 TWh, -27.6%). Although warmer countries could have larger 273 reduction potentials in the residential sector, we did not find a significant correlation between heating consumption
- 274 reduction and mean winter temperature (p=0.24, Fig S10).

275 Conversely, we discovered that reductions in gas consumption within the residential heating sector were positively 276 correlated with temperature anomalies (Pearson's r= 0.49, p<0.05, Fig 4a). To explore the impact of warmer 277 temperature anomalies, the average day-to-day temperature difference between pre- and post-invasion winters, we 278 developed a behavior-climate attribution model using TGC curves that attribute consumption reductions to either 279 behavioral changes or temperature variations (see method). We found lower heating consumptions for the same 280 temperature (flatter slope of TGC diagrams) and a lower heating inception temperature (smaller intercepts of TGC 281 diagrams) during the post-invasion winters. The consumption changes in the residential sector were primarily 282 attributed to behavioral change (73%, Fig 4a), even though warmer post-invasion winter conditions (temperature 283 comparison see Table S5) have been extensively reported to mitigate the impact of gas supply reductions in the EU 284 (Prince et al., 2023)(McWilliams et al., 2023). Those significant behavioral saving changes can be the potential 285 response to intentional reductions due to high energy prices, government campaigns, or structural shifts away from 286 fossil gas use for heating with heating pumps (McWilliams et al., 2023) (Elliott, 2023).

#### 287 4.3.2.Power sector

During the post-invasion winters, all EU27&UK countries decreased their reliance on gas-powered electricity, with reductions ranging from 15.9% to 66.5% compared to pre-invasion levels. To explore whether these reductions might lead to an energy shortage (net power generation decline), we compared the mix of electricity generation sources for the pre- and post-invasion periods based on an explainable-reduction attribution model, which assesses whether the

decrease in gas-powered electricity generation could be replaced by other energy sources (see method).

Our analysis reveals that, on average, 35.0±22.9% of the days during the post-invasion winters in the EU27&UK
 experienced a net reduction in electricity generation due to decreased gas consumption in the power sector. These
 reductions accounted for 57% of the total electricity generation decline during the post-invasion winters (35.2 TWh

296 per winter). In particular, Italy experienced the largest and longest duration of electricity generation drop caused by

297 gas reductions (-7.5 TWh and 77.2% of winter days), followed by the UK(-3.8 TWh and 58.9%), and the Netherlands

**298** (-1.7 TWh and 58.3%), as depicted in Fig 4b.

Following the energy structural change in the power generation between the pre-invasion and post-invasion periods

- 300 (Fig S12 and S13), we estimate that 80±48% of the gas reduction in the power sector was compensated by alternative
- 301 power sources (Fig 4b). Among these substitutes, renewables including wind, solar, and hydropower, contributed the

302 majority of that substitution at 80%±22%, and their increases were always strongly correlated with the deficits of gas-

303 powered electricity (Pearson's r = -0.79, p<0.05, Fig 4b and S15). Countries with the highest share of renewable-

304 power substitution included Spain (9.2 TWh), followed by the Netherlands (7.2 TWh) and France (6.6 TWh).

- 305 Substitution by oil and coal, contributed only 10±13%, while nuclear power contributed only a small proportion of
- **306** 5% (Fig 4b) because French reactors had an extremely low availability.
- While cross-border electricity imports could theoretically mitigate some gas-related electricity shortages, their rolewas limited during the crisis due to widespread power generation deficits across most EU countries (Fig S14).
- 309 However, Spain played a crucial role by significantly increasing renewable electricity generation in the first winter

- and reducing its gas consumption in the second winter, allowing it to support regional energy stability through both
- **311** electricity exports and LNG redistribution (Fig 3).
- 312 Compared to our initial predictions about how the shortfall in Russian gas would be addressed (Fig 6, right panel), the
- 313 power sector exhibited the largest discrepancy. We had largely overestimated European gas-substitution capacity in
- 314 power generation as we did not anticipate the shortfall of nuclear and hydropower in France (Fig S14) (EDF France,
- **315** 2023) (Castellano et al., 2023).

#### 316 4.3.3.Industrial sector

- 317 We lastly looked at adjustments to industrial production, a sector particularly sensitive to supply-side energy shocks
- 318 or high gas prices. All EU27&UK countries reduced their industrial gas consumption during the post-invasion winters
- by an average of 26.3±14.6%. Germany saw the largest reduction per winter (41.0 TWh), contributing 25.1% of the
- 320 total reduction across EU27&UK, followed by Spain (31.6 TWh), France (14.2 TWh), and Italy (12.3 TWh).
- 321 The reduction in industrial gas consumption, both for energy and raw material uses, can lead to a decline in industrial
- 322 output (Eurostat, 2023 b) (Energy Statistics, 2023). However, the industrial gas consumption reduction in energy use
- 323 can also be associated with a structural adjustment to heating techniques, such as the adoption of heat pumps (see
- 324 method and Fig S16), which were not expected to negatively impact industrial production (McWilliams et al., 2023)
- **325** (Castellano et al., 2023).
- Using a gas-electricity conversion efficiency of 0.7, our reduction attribution model indicates that on 70% of the post invasion winter days (Fig 5a and b), the reductions in industrial gas consumption cannot be explained by the increases
   in total electricity generation, suggesting that decreased industrial production were likely caused by gas consumption
   reductions. Consequently, our results show that across the EU27&UK, 5.7±9.3 TWh of the total industrial gas
- **330** reduction  $(76\pm 27\%)$  might translated into a lower industrial production (Fig 5c).
- 331 Although the actual impact on the industrial sector might be overestimated due to our assumption of no fuel-switching
- to fossil fuels, our upper-bound analysis highlights the significant industrial impact for EU countries, which in turn
- implies the substantial electricity demand required if the EU transitions toward industrial electrification to replace
- antural gas and other fossil fuels. While industrial heat pumps provide viable pathways for reducing reliance on fossil
- 335 fuels, the large electricity demand suggested by our study would necessitate a significant expansion of clean electricity
- 336 generation and grid capacity to further ensure the energy security in EU. The feasibility of this transition depends on
- 337 the EU's ability to scale up renewable energy sources while reinforcing grid infrastructure to support increased
- industrial electricity consumption.

#### 339 5.Discussion

#### 340 5.1.LNG is a structural alternative to Russian gas

341 During the post-invasion winters, the most notable development was the significant increase in LNG imports into the

- 342 EU27&UK, which surged from 20.7 % to 37.5% of the total gas supply. EU countries are actively expanding their
- 343 LNG import capacities by an additional 13% of the current capacity in the near term (Table S3), positioning LNG as

- a structural alternative to Russian pipeline gas. However, the reliability of global LNG supply to EU27&UK remains
- uncertain. In 2022, the major global LNG supply increment came from the U.S., accounting for 142 TWh (Global
- 346 liquefied natural gas trade volumes set a new record in 2022, 2023) (Australia exports record LNG in 2022:
- 347 EnergyQuest, 2023), which was still insufficient to meet Europe's increased winter LNG demands. Our previous
- 348 forecasts (Fig 6, right panel) underestimated the importance of additional LNG supply in mitigating the gas crisis
- 349 because we assumed constant global LNG demand. Europe therefore may have benefited from substantial reductions
- in Chinese LNG demand in 2022 (202 TWh) due to zero COVID-19 measures and renewed energy production from
- 351 coal (IEA, 2023,b) (US EIA, 2023) (Chatterjee et al., 2023). In addition, despite the geopolitical tensions, a substantial
- volume of LNG imports continued from Russia (Pécout, 2023).
- 353 Continuing and long-term reliance on LNG imports may pose considerable economic and climate risks for Europe.354 The cost of gas supplied via LNG is notably higher when compared to pipeline gas, primarily due to the increased
- 355 expenses associated with transportation, liquefaction, and regasification (Shah, 2023). These costs can translate into
- 356 elevated end-user gas prices, as reflected in the doubling of household gas and energy costs (Fig S6). Despite the large
- 357 GHG emissions associated with LNG liquefaction, our estimations suggest that, solely during transportation, LNG
- tankers might produce 2.4 times the amount of CO2-equivalent emissions compared to pipelines when supplying the
- 359 same amount of gas, even after accounting for a potential leakage rate of 1.4% from Russian pipeline transportation
- 360 (see supplementary materials) (Lelieveld et al., 2005) (Abrahams et al., 2015).
- 361 Dutch TTF (Title Transfer Facility) natural gas prices (Fig S5) exhibited a sharp rise in the winter of 2022-2023 in
- 362 response to the profound supply pattern changes following the Russian invasion of Ukraine, peaked at three times
- 363 compared to the pre-invasion levels. Nevertheless, the TTF price has since returned to pre-invasion levels for the
- 364 second post-invasion winter (winter of 2023-2024), suggesting a potential alleviation of the gas crisis through existing
- 365 gas supply-consumption dynamics.

#### 366 5.2.Norway and Northern Africa are stabilizers of gas supply

- 367 The increase in gas supply from Norway and North Africa to Europe during the post-invasion winters was much 368 smaller than the LNG increment, contributing only 28.9% of the total LNG increase. However, their contributions 369 were crucial as "stabilizers" in balancing the gas supply shortages within the EU27&UK by redirecting their exports 370 to those countries that experienced larger reductions in Russian supply and had infrastructural constraints in accessing 371 extra LNG supply. For instance, Norway redirected its gas exports from France and the Netherlands to Germany, 372 while North African exporters redirected their gas exports from Spain to Italy, as shown in Fig 3. Notably, in Germany,
- 373 the share of Norwegian gas in the total supply jumped from 33.5% to 60.4%, effectively replacing Russian gas as the
- 374 primary source. Similarly, Italy increased its reliance on North African gas from 22.7% to 44.1% of its total supply.

#### 375 5.3.Germany has reshaped the intra-EU gas transmission

- 376 To address the gas shortage in Germany, significant adjustments of the intra-EU gas transmission network were
- 377 observed, involving a net reversal of the historical East-to-West flow direction (Fig 3). Substantial increments of intra-
- 378 country transmissions were seen from countries that are equipped with large, preexisting terminals, e.g. Belgium and

379 the Netherlands, to Germany (Fig 3). New transmission pathways developed to service Germany, indicating close 380 cooperation among European member states, as shown in Fig 3: 1) transmissions from France to Germany came online 381 in October 2022 (210 TWh) (Zhou et al., 2023) by resolving the different gas odorization systems between the two 382 countries, 2) Denmark and Sweden reduced their reliance on Germany transmission by directly importing gas from 383 Norway. and 3) Germany began its own direct LNG imports in December 2022 (14 TWh) via the newly developed 384 LNG terminals (Waldholz et al., 2023). The resolution of gas odorization differences enabled direct France to 385 Germany gas transmission, overcoming a longstanding technical barrier (Zhou et al., 2023), though a significant 386 bypass route through France-Belgium to Germany remains visible in Fig. 3, highlighting ongoing efforts toward full 387 network integration. While the changes in the gas transmission network may not be permanent-pending the 388 establishment of German LNG terminals or a reduction in its structural dependency on gas-the overall shift in intra-389 EU gas transmission from Eastern to Western Europe, previously dominated by Russian supplies, has been structurally 390 reversed.

#### 391 5.4.Behavioral heating reduction is economic-sensitive

392 In residential heating, consumption reductions were primarily driven by behavioral changes as previously discussed. 393 The declines in isothermic gas heating consumption during the post-invasion winters (flatter slopes of TGC in Fig S9) 394 can be associated with the concurrent, rapid surge in heat pump sales within the EU and their increasing adoption in 395 household heating (European Heat Pump Association, 2023). The heat pumps, despite their superior heating 396 efficiency, may not necessarily lead to lower overall residential heating costs. This is partly due to higher electricity 397 prices caused by increased demand from both residential and industrial sectors using heat pumps (Fig S6 a), which 398 can offset the cost benefits of transitioning from gas heaters. Additionally, lower start heating temperatures (Fig S9) 399 were observed, corresponding to the base temperature in HDDs model, which indicating the reduced comfort levels 400 for heating inception and were likely driven by rising gas and energy prices (Fig S6). Therefore, further shifts away 401 from gas to heat pumps in residential heating are economically sensitive and depend on the dynamics between gas and 402 electricity supply and pricing.

#### 403 5.5. Structural independent from gas-powered electricity

404 The substantial growth of renewables was found in the post-invasion winters and it dominated the substitution of gas-405 powered electricity (Fig 4b). In the initial post-invasion period, fossil fuel substitution remained significant, 406 particularly in Germany and Italy (Fig S14 a), accounting for 48% of the substitution in these two countries. However, 407 by the second post-invasion winter (winter 2023-2024), renewable energy took the lead across all EU27&UK 408 countries, with renewables accounting for an increased substitution rate of 114%, suggesting the structural shifting 409 from gas-powered electricity has been successfully developing in EU27&UK.

- 410 On the other hand, the contribution of nuclear energy to this substitution was considerably lower than expected due to
- 411 the maintenance of the French nuclear reactor fleet and Germany's phase-out of nuclear power (Fig S14). Nevertheless,
- 412 nuclear energy might regain strategic importance in offsetting gas-fueled power generation in the future, particularly

- as some French reactors come back online and the demand for electricity increases due to widespread heat pumpinstallations.
- 415 The expansion of electricity production through alternative energy sources, such as green electricity and nuclear
- 416 power, offers a dual benefit. It not only substitutes for gas-fueled power generation but also supports gas reduction in
- 417 the residential heating and industrial sectors through the adoption of heat pumps. Achieving full structural
- 418 independence from gas still presents challenges in the near term due to existing electricity infrastructure constraints,
- 419 transitioning toward green electricity, and nuclear power maintenance issues.

#### 420 5.6.Pathway to EU Energy Security

- 421 Our analysis of the structural and temporary shifts in European gas and energy supply and consumption patterns during
- 422 the post-invasion winters underscores the region's institutional and infrastructural resilience to this energy crisis. We
- 423 found that energy security has been and will continue to be enhanced by: 1) increasing LNG imports to diversify gas
- 424 supply sources, 2) strengthening both international and intra-EU cooperation, and 3) systematically reducing gas
- 425 dependency by decreasing residential gas heating and expanding the use of renewable and nuclear power.
- 426 While addressing existing challenges on the pathway to the EU energy security, such as the dynamics of the global
- 427 LNG market, EU gas infrastructure capacities, and the potential impact on climate change, we also identify key areas
- 428 that require further attention (European Parliament, 2023): 1) Systematic substitution of heat fuel from gas to
- 429 electricity will require systematic increases in power supply and generation capacity; 2) In turn, rising electrical
- 430 demand will need to be met with expansions in power generation, preferably through renewable energy sources; 3)
- 431 Effective energy redistribution, including both gas and electricity, among EU countries will call for a unified strategy
- 432 that includes greater integration and enhancement of both physical and institutional infrastructures.

#### 433 6.Data availability

- We updated one dataset (EUGasSC) and published two new datasets (EUGasNet and EUGasImpact) as CSV files,
  and they are hosted on the Zenodo platform: <a href="https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.11175364">https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.11175364</a> (Zhou et al., 2024). The
  EUGasSC and EUGasNet datasets are available from 2016, while the EUGasImpact dataset is available only for the
  two post-invasion winters. The datasets are open-access and are licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0
- 438 International license. The column headings of the data dictionary files as well as the unit of each variable are listed in439 Table S4.
- Our datasets provide daily updates on gas supply, storage, transmission, and consumption, providing sectoral and country-specific data on the European gas landscape. Our datasets also capture the pattern changes after the Russian invasion of Ukraine, as well as the driving factors of those changes. These datasets can serve as either input or reference datasets for further research across various fields, including gas/energy modeling, carbon emission studies, climate change impacts, geopolitical policy discussions, and international gas/energy market analysis. By offering multidimensional insights, our data facilitate a comprehensive understanding of the dynamics within the EU gas
- 446 landscape and contribute to outlining pathways toward EU energy security. Chuanlong Zhou, who collected the data

and performed the analysis, and Philippe Ciais, who is an expert on the background of this study, are at the disposalof researchers wishing to reuse the datasets.

#### 449 7.Conclusions

450 We updated one dataset (EUGasSC) and introduced two new datasets (EUGasNet and EUGasImpact) for the EU27 451 and UK at daily resolutions: (1) the EUGasSC dataset, describing the sectoral and country-based daily natural gas 452 supply, storage, and consumption, (2) the EUGasNet dataset, describing the intra-EU gas transmission with specified 453 supply source data, and 3) the EUGasImpact, describing the sector-specific gas consumption changes between the 454 pre- and post- invasion winters, combining with the contributions of driving factors. Together, these datasets offer 455 multidimensional insights into the dynamics within the EU gas landscape, and can be valuable to future research on 456 various fields and topics, such as energy modeling, carbon emission analysis, climate change research, and policy 457 discussions. 458 Using these datasets, we analyzed the pattern changes of the EU gas landscape between the pre- and post-invasion 459 winters. We show how the EU27&UK adapted their gas supply, transmission, and consumption patterns in response

to the gas crisis. We quantified the contribution of driving factors in the residential heating, power, and industrial sectors. Our findings indicate significant changes and growing structural independence from gas during the postinvasion winters: 1) total gas consumption decreased by 19.0% due to the sudden loss of Russian gas, 2) LNG emerged as the largest gas supply source, accounting for 37.5% of the total gas supply, 3) Intra-EU gas transmission adjustments focused primarily on addressing the significant shortfall in Germany, 4) behavioral changes in household heating individually contributed most to consumption reduction (29%), 5) renewable electricity dominated the substituted gaspowered electricity (93%), and 6) relatively large consumption reductions can be associated with declines in industrial

467 production and power shortage (34%).



469

470 Fig 1. Study workflow and conceptual framework of this study. The workflow of this study includes input datasets, 471

supply-storage-consumption model, sector-specific consumption change attribution models, and three daily output 472 datasets for the EU gas landscape on supply, transmission, and impacts. The supply-storage-consumption model has

473 been described in our previous work (Zhou et al. 2023).



Fig 2. Winter gas supply in EU27&UK from 2019 to 2024. This figure displays monthly and winter-aggregated gas
supply amounts (narrow and wide bars, respectively) and their shares (line graphs) from 2019 to 2024. The gas supply
sources are differentiated by color, including pipeline imports from Russia (RU), Norway+Serbia (OTHER\_EU),
Libya+Algeria (NORTH\_AFRICA), and Turkey+Azerbaijan(MIDDLE\_EAST), LNG imports (LNG), and EU local
productions (EU\_PRODUCTION).



Fig 3. The annual net flow changes in gas imports and intra-EU transmission network between pre-invasion
(2019-04-01 to 2022-03-31) and post-invasion periods (2022-04-01 to 2024-03-31). The figure illustrates changes
by subtracting annual average pre-invasion values from post-invasion values. Positive values indicate increments in
the post-invasion period. Circle sizes represent changes in transmission amounts by country (green for increases, red
for decreases). Intra-EU transmissions (edges) are color-coded (green for increase, red for decrease) with imports
differentiated by import sources. Note that the flow directions are shown based on the major flow directions in the
post-invasion period (detail see methods).



488 489 490 491 492 493 493 494 495 496

**Fig 4. Consumption change attributions in the residential heating (top) and power sector (bottom) in EU27&UK.** The gas consumption changes in the heating sector is separated into behavioral change (solid color bars) and climatic change (hatched bars). The daily gas-powered electricity generation change is separated into the replaceable reduction (solid color bars), the non-replaceable reduction (red hatched bars), and the increment (beige hatched bars). The green energy importance (%) is the share of green energy in the substituted gas-powered electricity. The correlation between temperature increment and heating consumption reduction is shown in the top-right panel. The correlation between gas-powered electricity increment and renewable power increment is shown in the bottom-right panel.





Fig 5. Analysis of potential impact on industrial productions. In the subplots: a) explainable-reduction attribution model with daily comparisons of gas consumption in industrial and total electricity generation, b) time series of industrial gas reduction and reduction that can be filled with electricity generation, and c) the amount (bar) and proportion (choropleth) of reductions that potentially impact industrial production. The color bands in panel (b)
 represent the 95% confidence interval (CI) across countries. R2 of the linear regression is 0.38 with a p-value < 0.01.</li>





### 514 Competing interests

- 515 The contact author has declared that none of the authors has any competing interests.
- 516 Appendix
- 517 Table. Descriptions of column headers and units of EUGasNet and EUGasImpact.

Dataset	Header	Description	Unit
EUGasNet	date	Transmission date	DateTime
	fromCountry	Start country key	CountryKey
	toCountry	End country key	CountryKey
	LNG_share	Supply ratio from LNG	0-1
	PRO_share	Supply ratio from EU Production	0-1
	RU_share	Supply ratio from Russian Production	0-1
	AZ_share	Supply ratio from Azerbaijan	0-1
	DZ_share	Supply ratio from Algeria	0-1
	NO_share	Supply ratio from Norway	0-1
	RS_share	Supply ratio from Serbia	0-1
	TR_share	Supply ratio from Turkey	0-1
	LY_share	Supply ratio from Libya	0-1
	TotalFlow	Total transmission ammount	KWh
EUGasImpact	date	date	DateTime
	country	country	CountryKey
	house_heating	Consumption of house heating	GWh
	house_heating_diff_total	Consumption difference compared to pre-invasion periods	GWh
	house_heating_diff_T	Consumption differences caused by temperature	GWh
	house_heating_diff_behavior	Consumption differences caused by behavior	GWh
	house_heating_residual	Consumption differences residual	GWh

	public_heating	Consumption of public heating	GWh
	public_heating_diff_total	Consumption difference compared to pre-invasion periods	GWh
	public_heating_diff_T	Consumption differences caused by temperature	GWh
	public_heating_diff_behavior	Consumption differences caused by behavior	GWh
	public_heating_residual	Consumption differences residual	GWh
	power_generated_with_gas	Power generated with gas	GWh
	power_generated_with_gas_diff	Differences in power generated with gas compared to pre- invasion periods	GWh
	power_dorp_filled_with_fossil	Gas-powered electricity reduction (if exists) replaced by fossil electricity	GWh
	power_dorp_filled_with_green	Gas-powered electricity reduction (if exists) replaced by green electricity	GWh
	power_dorp_filled_with_nuclea r	Gas-powered electricity reduction (if exists) replaced by nuclear electricity	GWh
	power_dorp_can_not_filled	Gas-powered electricity reduction (if exists) can not be replaced	GWh
	industrial	Consumption of industrial	GWh
	industrial_diff	Consumption difference compared to pre-invasion periods	GWh
	reduced_impact_industrial_prod uction	Consumption reduction (if exists) might reduce industrial production	GWh

#### 520 References

- 521 Abnett, K.: Europe experienced second-warmest winter on record, Reuters, 9th March, 2023.
- 522 Askew, J.: What measures are European countries taking to conserve energy? https://www.euronews.com/my-523 524 europe/2022/10/21/what-measures-are-european-countries-taking-to-conserve-energy, last access: 4 July 2023.
- Castellano, C., and Varela, C.: The gas situation in Europe remains favorable thanks to contained demand and stable supply, 525 resulting in g...: https://www.bbvaresearch.com/en/publicaciones/europe-natural-gas-toward-winter-2024/, last access: 3 July 526 2023
- 527 Chatterjee, A., and Hunter, N.: China fuels economic recovery with higher coal imports, not LNG, in Q1: 528 https://www.spglobal.com/commodityinsights/en/market-insights/latest-news/energy-transition/042723-china-fuels-economic-
- 529 recovery-with-higher-coal-imports-not-lng-in-q1, last access: 24 October 2023.
- 530 Ciais, P., Bréon, F.-M., Dellaert, S., Wang, Y., Tanaka, K., Gurriaran, L., Françoise, Y., Davis, S. J., Hong, C., Penuelas, J., 531 532 Janssens, I., Obersteiner, M., Deng, Z., and Liu, Z.: Impact of Lockdowns and Winter Temperatures on Natural Gas Consumption in Europe, Earth's Future, 10, e2021EF002250, 2022.
- 533 534 Parliament: Four challenges energy European of the crisis for the EU's strategic autonomy: https://www.europarl.europa.eu/thinktank/en/document/EPRS\_BRI(2023)747099, last access: 8 November 2023.
- 535 EDF France: List of outages and messages: https://www.edf.fr/en/the-edf-group/who-we-are/activities/optimisation-and-536 537 trading/list-of-outages-and-messages/list-of-outages, last access: 27 July 2023.
- European Heat Pump Association: Heat Pumps in Europe Key Facts and Figures: https://www.ehpa.org/heat-pumps-in-europe-538 key-facts-and-figures/, last access: 11 September 2023.
- 539 540 S.: Denmark launches campaign; Elliott, energy saving European gas supply "under pressure": https://www.spglobal.com/commodityinsights/en/market-insights/latest-news/electric-power/062822-denmark-launches-energy-
- 541 saving-campaign-european-gas-supply-under-pressure, last access: 17 July 2023.
- 542 ENTSOG: https://transparency.entsog.eu/, last access: 17 June 2023.
- 543 Eurostat: Imports of natural gas by partner country, https://doi.org/https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/products-datasets/-544 /nrg ti gas, last access: 24 July 2023. a
- 545 Eurostat: Supply, transformation and consumption of gas: https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/products-datasets/-/nrg\_cb\_gas, last 546 access: 24 July 2023. b
- 547 Shah, A.: LNG vs. Pipeline Economics [Gaille Energy Blog Issue 66]: https://gaillelaw.com/2018/05/16/lng-vs-pipeline-548 economics-gaille-energy-blog-issue-66/, last access: 8 August 2023.
- 549 Household Energy Price Index: https://www.energypriceindex.com/, last access: 2 August 2023.
- 550 Hersbach, H., Bell, B., Berrisford, P., Biavati, G., Horányi, A., Muñoz Sabater, J., Nicolas, J., Peubey, C., Radu, R., and Rozum, 551 I.: ERA5 hourly data on single levels from 1979 to present, Copernicus climate change service (c3s) climate data store (cds), 552 https://doi.org/10.24381/cds.adbb2d47, n.d.
- 553 Hockenos, P.: Averting Crisis, Europe Learns to Live Without Russian Energy: https://e360.yale.edu/features/europe-energy-crisis-554 winter-gas-coal-wind-solar-emissions, last access: 4 July 2023.
- 555 Dutch TTF Natural Gas Futures: https://www.theice.com/products/27996665/Dutch-TTF-Gas-Futures/data?marketId=5600523, 556 last access: 2 August 2023.
- 557 IEA: Baseline European Union gas demand and supply in 2023 - How to Avoid Gas Shortages in the European Union in 2023 -558 Analysis: https://www.iea.org/reports/how-to-avoid-gas-shortages-in-the-european-union-in-2023/baseline-european-union-gas-559 demand-and-supply-in-2023, last access: 26 June 2023. a
- 560 Zeniewski, P., Molnar, G., and Hugues, P.: Europe's energy crisis: What factors drove the record fall in natural gas demand in 561 2022? https://www.iea.org/commentaries/europe-s-energy-crisis-what-factors-drove-the-record-fall-in-natural-gas-demand-in-562 2022, last access: 16 July 2023.
- 563 IEA: How the European Union can avoid natural gas shortages in 2023: https://www.iea.org/news/how-the-european-union-can-564 avoid-natural-gas-shortages-in-2023, last access: 3 July 2023. b
- 565 ENTSOG: LNG exports for selected countries, 2015-2025: https://www.entsog.eu/sites/default/files/2021-566 11/ENTSOG CAP 2021 A0 1189x841 FULL 066 FLAT.pdf, last access: 10 June 2020.
- 567 Kardaś, S.: Conscious uncoupling: Europeans' Russian gas challenge in 2023: https://ecfr.eu/article/conscious-uncoupling-568 europeans-russian-gas-challenge-in-2023/, last access: 4 July 2023.
- 569 Lelieveld, J., Lechtenböhmer, S., Assonov, S. S., Brenninkmeijer, C. A. M., Dienst, C., Fischedick, M., and Hanke, T.: Greenhouse 570 gases: low methane leakage from gas pipelines, Nature, 434, 841-842, 2005.
- 571 McWilliams, B., Tagliapietra, S., Zachmann, G., and Deschuyteneer, T.: Preparing for the next winter: Europe's gas outlook for 572 2023: https://www.bruegel.org/policy-brief/european-union-gas-survival-plan-2023, last access: 26 June 2023.
- 573 Australia exports record LNG in 2022: EnergyQuest: https://www.naturalgasworld.com/australia-exported-record-lng-in-2022-574 energyquest-103241, last access: 8 August 2023.
- 575 Mittakola, R. T., Ciais, P., and Zhou, C.: Short-to-medium range forecast of natural gas use in the United States residential 576 buildings, J. Clean. Prod., 437, 140687, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2024.140687, 2024.
- 577 Pécout, A.: L'Europe a augmenté ses importations de gaz russe par la mer, malgré la guerre en Ukraine, Le Monde, 11th September, 578 2023.
- 579 Prince, T.: A Test Of Endurance: Europe Faces A Chilling Couple Of Years, But Russia Stands To Lose The Energy Showdown:
- 580 https://www.rferl.org/a/russia-europe-energy-showdown-gas-cold-ukraine-war/32204068.html, last access: 26 June 2023.
- 581 Energy Statistics: https://unstats.un.org/unsd/energystats/methodology/ires/, last access: 24 July 2023.

- 582 US EIA: China's natural gas consumption and LNG imports declined in 2022, amid zero-COVID policies: 583 584 https://www.eia.gov/todayinenergy/detail.php?id=56680, last access: 7 August 2023.
- Global liquefied natural gas trade volumes set a new record in 2022: https://www.eia.gov/todayinenergy/detail.php?id=57000, last 585 access: 7 August 2023.
- 586 Waldholz, R., Wehrmann, B., and Wettengel, J.: Ukraine war pushes Germany to build LNG terminals:
- 587 https://www.cleanenergywire.org/factsheets/liquefied-gas-does-lng-have-place-germanys-energy-future, last access: 17 July 2023.
- 588 Zhou, C., Zhu, B., Davis, S. J., Liu, Z., Halff, A., Arous, S. B., de Almeida Rodrigues, H., and Ciais, P.: Natural gas supply from
- 589 590 Russia derived from daily pipeline flow data and potential solutions for filling a shortage of Russian supply in the European Union
- (EU), Earth Syst. Sci. Data, 15, 949–961, 2023.
- 591 Zhu, B., Deng, Z., Song, X., Zhao, W., Huo, D., Sun, T., Ke, P., Cui, D., Lu, C., Zhong, H., Hong, C., Qiu, J., Davis, S. J., Gentine,
- 592 P., Ciais, P., and Liu, Z.: CarbonMonitor-Power near-real-time monitoring of global power generation on hourly to daily scales, 593 Sci Data, 10, 217, 2023.
- 594 Zhou, C., Zhu, B., Ciais, P., Arous, S. B., Davis, S. J., and Liu, Z.: EU27&UK gas supply-transmission-consumption structures 595 with driving factors of consumption change, Zenodo [data set], https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.11175364.