

Dear Authors:

I have received five reviews of your manuscript. The first Referee has not provided any substantial criticism. The second Referee has provided extensive comments and recommended re-considering the manuscript after major revision. The 3rd and 4th reviewers recommended that the manuscript be rejected. Criticisms of all Referees were addressed in your responses. I carefully read their arguments, as well as your answers, and came to the conclusion that your position is well founded and your responses successfully smooth all the main criticisms of the Referees. I appreciate your clear responses. As a result, I asked the second Referee to provide additional review of the revised manuscript and received the review. I am pleased to note that the manuscript has been significantly improved, and only technical changes are recommended at this stage:

the figures containing maps (fig 1 and fig 5) need to be improved. Please add a scale bar or a coordinate grid at the outside borders of the map for orientation.

After these minor edits, I recommend the manuscript for publication.

Alexander Gelfan,  
ESSD Editor