

Interactive comment on “A satellite-derived database for stand-replacing windthrows in boreal forests of the European Russia in 1986–2017” by Andrey N. Shikhov et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 20 July 2020

The manuscript described the development of a satellite-driven GIS database containing information on stand-replacing windthrows in boreal forests of the European Russia between 1986 and 2017. Based on this database the spatial and temporal distribution of windthrows in European Russia is also presented in the manuscript. The manuscript is well structured and written (although the large number of acronyms make the reading difficult in places) and is free of errors in logic. Furthermore, the manuscript is filling a gap concerning the climatology of severe storms in European Russia, especially in the sparsely populated area.

Minor comments

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



line 10: "natural disturbances" is not clearly defined in this context

line 14: "[...] determine the type of"

line 17: "[...] with an area"

line 18: replace "contained" with "containing"

line 21: "[...] happened in the summer"

line 24: no need to include this information in the abstract.

line 29: from my point of view "disturbance" is not a good choice of word in this context

line 36: "Particularly, both the [...]"

line 45: "[...] convective storms in the warm season"

line 50: not sure what "macro-regional" is in this context

line 52: replace "presented" with "compiled"

line 54: remove extra open parenthesis

line 100: "[...] that occurred"

lines 151-155: maybe the authors should add a figure containing examples of the "three hierarchical levels"

line 208-210: the choice of thresholds is not clearly defined

lines 220-240: is not clear how the thresholds used in this section have been derived

line 261: the ratio of length to width of 10:1 is based on previous studies conducted for European Russia?

line 323: "[...] we calculated as well"

line 323: "estimation" instead of "estimating"

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



line 348: citation not in the correct form

line 361: citation not in the correct form

line 439: "storm events occurred"

line 472: is not clear what the authors meant by "contain fewer plots"

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2020-91>, 2020.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

