

Interactive comment on “MIS 5e sea-level proxies in the eastern Mediterranean coastal region” by Barbara Mauz et al.

Alessio Rovere (Editor)

arovere@marum.de

Received and published: 18 January 2021

Dear Authors,

I now had time to read the reviews of your paper and your successive comments. First of all, I would like to commend the work of the two reviewers. In my opinion, they approached the review with a constructive approach, raised valid concerns, and suggested several ways to improve the quality of your work. From your answers, it is clear that there is a fundamental disagreement in how you wish to respond to these comments, and I find it very unfortunate that you did not follow common scientific practice and decided not to discuss these matters internally and come to a mutual agreement on how to proceed with the paper revisions.

C1

I was advised by journal managers that the journal cannot remove comments that are made public. If your disagreement is final, the reasonable thing to do at this stage from an editorial standpoint would be to register your disagreement and reject the paper in its present form.

Out of respect for your work and for that of the reviewers, I am willing to extend the end of the discussion one week from today (18 Jan 2021). In case you can solve your differences internally and draft a response to the reviewers with a clear and explicit agreement from all authors and co-authors, I will consider it and decide whether to invite you to submit a revised manuscript. Otherwise the paper will be rejected in its present form, on the grounds that you are unable to answer the reviewers comments in a full and satisfactory manner.

As a final note, I would like to let you know that, before writing this email, I consulted with the other Special Issue guest editors. We all regret this situation. The WALIS Special Issue intends to bring together the paleo sea-level community, bridging across disciplines and ideas, and not creating divisions and unpleasant situations such as this one

Best regards,

Alessio Rovere

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2020-357>, 2020.

C2