Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss.,
https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2020-274-RC1, 2021

Open Access Earth System Science Data Discussions

Interactive comment on "Historical cartographic and topo-bathymetric database on the French Rhône River (17th–20th centuries)" *by* Fanny Arnaud et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 8 January 2021

It is very important in fluvial studies to collect as long dataset as possible, because it is the only one way to understand the evolution of rivers. Within this study large amount of data were collected and made available, providing a good database for further studies. I expected throughout of the text (and the tables) to have some kind of scientific note on the accuracy of the maps and surveys, which are important for a user: if they want to understand the changes: e.g. the map was made after a large flood, or after a long-lasting dry period, or at low stage etc. Anything, what could help the work of future users. . .. You referred several times to Arnaud et al. 2020. But it is not clear for the reader, why/how is this article more or different compared to that publication. Please, clear it! L. 65. Please, reformulate these sentences, and indicate what are the aims of

your research. L. 70: Study area: Would be great to have some data on the regime of the river, like annual timing of low stages and floods, duration of floods, differences between the lowest and highest stages, and how did these parameters change. It is important, as the hydrology of the river influences the result of the mapping, thus the precision of the derived data. L. 110-115: It is not necessary to mention, that how many days you had spent in Archives. Usually a research takes days and months. . . Fig 1. What is indicated by the grey colour? Please add to the legend! Fig.9. Please provide a scalebar and the north direction (as on Fig. 3 and 5 you use various directions) Table1. I do not understand this table, as it has two very distinct parts. Would better to split it into two parts.

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2020-274, 2020.