Manuscript Title	: Hyperspectral longwave infrared reflectance spectra of dry anthropogenic plastics and natural materials
Authors	: Garaba, Acuña-Ruz and B. Mattar
Journal	: Earth System Science Data (ESSD)

Anonymous Referee #2

Comment	Response	Revision Implemented
C1.	R1.	None
This manuscript describes an	We appreciate the positive feedback and the time taken to review our	
interesting database of	manuscript.	
reflectance/emissivity spectra of		
some manmade plastics and natural		
materials. Because laboratory		
measurements include a wide		
spectral range (UV-VNIR-SWIR-		
TIR), this dataset can be used for		
identification of plastics with a		
number of remote sensors. The		
manuscript is well organized, and		
description of dataset is clear (and it		
is also freely available in PANGEA).		
C2.	R2.	(See Section 2.2 Directional hemispherical reflectance
I have some minor suggestions to the	Thank you for pointing this out. To the best of our knowledge, there are	measurements Page 4 Line 8 of the revised manuscript).
authors: Section 2.2: the	eight HyLogger-3 TM spectrometers in the world, which have the same	HyLogger-3 TM spectrometer has 341 wavebands and a
measurement protocol is a key factor	instrument specifications for reflectance measurements. We use the same	peak signal-to-noise ratio (≥ 2000 at $8\mu m$) for a Lambertian
in this research. I think the	protocols described in Schodlock et al., (2016).	surface with 100 % directional hemispherical spectral
section could be expanded by		reflectance. Detailed specifications of the instrument have
providing more info on the	We have appended this information about the instrument in the methods	been reported in a prior study and we conducted our
instrument (e.g. Signal-to-noise	section to clarify this point.	experiments following the proposed operating protocol of
ratio for each port, etc.)		the instrument (Schodlok et al., 2016).
C3.	R3.	Figure 10 has been removed.
Section 4: Not sure if Figure 10 is	We agree with the reviewer.	
really necessary at this point.		

Comment	Response	Revision Implemented
C4.	R4.	(See Section <u>4. Discussion</u> Paragraph 4, Line 27 of the
However, I think it would be very	This is a good point. The current TIR missions have moderate geo-	revised manuscript).
interesting to discuss the limitation	spatial and limited spectral resolutions but this can be resolved by	In spite of the challenges associated with varying geo-
of current EO sensors for detection	utilizing airborne or shipborne platforms.	spatial resolution of remotely sensed imagery, including
of plastics. The authors identified		decreased chances to detect plastic litter in the visible
characteristic peaks of each	We have added text to discuss more on this.	spectrum (Acuña-Ruz et al., 2018), satellites provide
reflectance spectra,		essential information about the environment. Satellite
so it would be interesting to discuss		missions with TIR sensors include ASTER from the
if these characteristic peaks can be		National Aeronautics and Space Administration/Japanese
"captured"		Ministry of Economy Trade and Industry, ECOSTRESS
by current EO sensors. This is		from National Aeronautics and Space Administration as
probably more difficult with current		well as Landsat-8 from the United States Geologic Survey.
TIR sensors, with		The capabilities (TIR spectral, geo-spatial, revisit interval)
limitations on the number of spectral		of ASTER, ECOSTRESS and Landsat-8 missions must be
bands.		assessed with a focus on detecting aggregated litter zones,
		considering the geo-spatial resolutions of these sensors (38
		- 100 m). We need to further emphasize that the
		atmospheric window in the TIR is relatively wide. This
		atmospheric window contained a significant number of
		diagnostic wavebands of anthropogenic materials we
		studied and it would be vital to explore development of
		detection algorithms using the limited (2 - 5 wavebands)
		spectral information available on these current TIR
		missions.
C5.	R5.	(See Section <u>4. Discussion</u> Paragraph 1, Line 8 of the
The ECOSTRESS spectral library	We checked the ECOSTRESS repository and the similarities are based on	revised manuscript).
includes a number of manmade and	the material being anthropogenic or synthetic products. We think it does	We are convinced our TIR sample subset provide
natural materials. I don't know if it	merit a comprehensive comparison of these datasets but it would fall out	invaluable complementary insights to the interdisciplinary
includes materials similar to the	of the scope of the current manuscript.	scientific evidence-based knowledge global plastic litter.
samples collected and measured by	We compare the point in the discussion protion of this blick the	To this end, it is recommended that within the TIR remote
the authors. In this case, a rough	We acknowledge this point in the discussion section and highlight the some related libraries/studies.	sensing community a comprehensive high quality assured
comparison between these measurements could be an option for	some related horaries/studies.	and quality controlled spectral reference library be established to carefully harmonize available TIR
a brief test of the data presented by		measurements from various works e.g. ECOSTRESS
the authors.		(Meerdink et al., 2019), SLUM (Kotthaus et al., 2014) or
the authors.		contaminated anthropogenic surfaces (Kerekes et al.,
		2008).
		2000).

References

Acuña-Ruz, T., Uribe, D., Taylor, R., Amézquita, L., Guzmán, M. C., Merrill, J., Martínez, P., Voisin, L., and Mattar B., C.: Anthropogenic marine debris over beaches: Spectral characterization for remote sensing applications, Remote Sens. Environ., 217, 309-322, doi:10.1016/j.rse.2018.08.008, 2018.

Kerekes, J. P., Strackerjan, K.-E., and Salvaggio, C.: Spectral reflectance and emissivity of man-made surfaces contaminated with environmental effects, Opt. Eng., 47, 106201(106201-106210), doi:10.1117/1.3000433, 2008.

Kotthaus, S., Smith, T. E. L., Wooster, M. J., and Grimmond, C. S. B.: Derivation of an urban materials spectral library through emittance and reflectance spectroscopy, ISPRS J. Photogramm. and Remote Sens., 94, 194-212, doi:10.1016/j.isprsjprs.2014.05.005, 2014.

Meerdink, S. K., Hook, S. J., Roberts, D. A., and Abbott, E. A.: The ECOSTRESS spectral library version 1.0, Remote Sens. Environ., 230, 111196, doi:10.1016/j.rse.2019.05.015, 2019.

Schodlok, M. C., Whitbourn, L., Huntington, J., Mason, P., Green, A., Berman, M., Coward, D., Connor, P., Wright, W., Jolivet, M., and Martinez, R.: HyLogger-3, a visible to shortwave and thermal infrared reflectance spectrometer system for drill core logging: functional description, Aust. J. Earth Sci., 63, 929-940, doi:10.1080/08120099.2016.1231133, 2016.