

Editorial comments to the revised version of essd-2020-139 “Petrophysical and mechanical rock property database of the Los Humeros and Acozulco geothermal fields (Mexico)” by Leandra M. Weydt et al.

Dear Leandra Weydt and co-authors,

First of all, many thanks for your revision of the manuscript according to the suggestions of the referees. Before finally accepting the manuscript for publication in ESSD, I would like to ask you for some additional adjustments of the manuscript listed below. My source is your Author’s response from 12 November 2020. My main requests are to include some of your answers to referee comments in the manuscript. This can avoid similar questions from readers and improve the data description. I have listed my specific comments below.

Manuscript main text

Comment to “Referee 1 – C2 line 329”

I think that the “second datasheet of the database” is still a little unprecise. Accessing the DOI of the data, I find 3 Excel data tables and one data description pdf. The Excel files are (1) the full database with 9 spreadsheets, (2) a file with petrophysical and rock mechanical properties with 1 spreadsheet and (3) a file with geochemical data in one spreadsheet. To make the correct link to the respective data file and spreadsheet I suggest to include the file (and spreadsheet) in the manuscript. You could further consider to add a citation to the data, e.g. “(Weydt et. al., 2020)”

Comments to your answers to “Referee 1- C2 line 350”

Please include a summary of your answer in the manuscript to avoid similar questions by readers

Comment to “Referee 1 – C2 line 353 and 439”:

Please include your explanations on the effectiveness of saturating samples by leaving them submersed in water in the manuscript. If the referee had this question, we can easily avoid similar question by addressing this topic in the manuscript.

Comment to “Referee 1 – C3 line 377”

Please include your comments on the Forchheimer correction in the manuscript

Comment to “Referee 1 – C3 line 425”

Please include a summary of your comment in the manuscript

Comment on “Referee 2, line 29-31 in the authors response” –

It would be interesting to include your comments on the usability of your database at other places in the discussion. I like your reorganised discussion and think adding a comment on the suitability of the database beyond Los Humeros would complement it.

References:

I also found some missing DOIs: please add them as a service for your readers who can directly access the data via the DOI links. Please also make sure that all DOIs in the references section are pre-set with <https://doi.org>.

Global comments:

- Please preset all DOIs with <https://doi.org/>
- Please change all “dx.doi.org” to “doi.org” (dx.doi.org is the old resolver that is not used anymore)
- Please change all “DOI: 10.xxx” and “doi: 10.xxx” or “doi10.xxx” to <https://doi.org/10.xxx> and make the links executable

Comments to individual references (mostly “please add DOIs”)

- Ali and Potter (2012): please write <https://doi.org/10.1190/GEO2011-0282.1>
- Békés et al. (2020): please remove the second “101880” after the DOI (this is a typo)
- Calcagno et al. 2018: please correct the DOI syntax from “doi: org/10” to <https://doi.org/10>”
- Christie (1996): <https://doi.org/10.2118/37324-JPT>
- Eggertsson et al. (2020) <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvolgeores.2018.04.008>
- Ferriz and Mahood (1984): <https://doi.org/10.1029/JB089iB10p08511>
- Fuentes-Guzmán et al (2020): the paper is published, please add the following DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.18268/BSGM2020v72n3a110520>
- Garcia Palomo et al. (2002): I suggest to add this URL: <http://www.revistas.unam.mx/index.php/geofisica/article/view/40100>
- Guo et al. (1993): [https://doi.org/10.1016/0013-7952\(93\)90056-l](https://doi.org/10.1016/0013-7952(93)90056-l)
- Hartmann et al. (2005): <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijrmms.2005.05.015>
- Heap et al. (2014): <https://doi.org/10.1002/2013JB010521>
- ISRM (1988): [https://doi.org/10.1016/0148-9062\(88\)91871-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/0148-9062(88)91871-2)
- Kummerow and Raab (2015): <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.egypro.2015.07.855>
- Navelot et al- (2018): please remove the “blank” in the DOI (after “eores”
- Ohnaka (1969): <https://doi.org/10.5636/jgg.21.495>
- Pola et al. (2014): <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enggeo.2013.11.011>
- Rühaak et al. (2015): <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geothermics.2015.08.004>
- Rybacki et al. (2015): <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.petrol.2016.02.022>
- Sanches-Vila et al. (2006): <https://doi.org/10.1029/2005RG000169>
- Saller and Henderson (1998): <https://doi.org/10.1306/1D9BCB01-172D-11D7-8645000102C1865D>
- Sass et al., (1971): <https://doi.org/10.1029/JB076i026p06376>
- Shankland et al. (1997): <https://doi.org/10.1029/96JB03389>
- Sosa Caballos et al. (2018) <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvolgeores.2018.06.002>
- Vinciguerra et al- (2008): <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijrmms.2005.05.022>
- Vosteen and Schellenschmidt (2003): [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1474-7065\(03\)00069-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1474-7065(03)00069-X)
- Wen and Gómez Hernandez (1996)_ [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0022-1694\(96\)80030-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0022-1694(96)80030-8)