

# ***Interactive comment on “The *fortedata* R package: open-science datasets from a manipulative experiment testing forest resilience” by Jeff W. Atkins et al.***

**Joseph Stachelek (Referee)**

stachel2@msu.edu

Received and published: 27 October 2020

## **1 General comments**

The authors of this paper have done an excellent job following the principles of open data. They have quite thoroughly documented their data and made it readily available in a variety of archives. A real highlight of their efforts is the use of R package testing infrastructure for data validation. I also like how the authors have used minimal software dependencies in their package. This is something that likely increases the project's long-term value.

## 2 Specific comments

Will the data size ever become unmanageable to ship with the package? The authors say they plan to submit the package to CRAN but the current package size ( 9mb) is larger than the CRAN limit of 5mb.

What is the planned data update frequency of fortedata? The authors say it will be updated as near-real time as possible. Is this likely to be annual, semi-annual, or some longer timestep?

L129: What is the approximate field season for the project?

I wish measurement units were embedded for all data columns. I see this is the case for `fd_inventory()$dbh_cm` but not `fd_soil_respiration$soil_co2_efflux`.

L211: A nice-to-have but certainly not required feature, a machine readable representation of the metadata associated with fortedata beyond the human readable manuscript.

Figures 3 and 5 are not referenced in the text.

Might want to add a URL and BugReports field to the DESCRIPTION file

## 3 Technical corrections

Abstract: I suggest using a different term for "level one data product" in the abstract or explaining it.

L24: ancillary measurements to help analyse and users analyse and interpret carbon cycling -> ancillary measurements to help users analyse and interpret carbon cycling

L43: This seems like an excessive number of citations for the preceding statement.

[Printer-friendly version](#)[Discussion paper](#)

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2020-112>, 2020.

**ESSDD**

---

Interactive  
comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

