

Interactive comment on “The fortedata R package: open-science datasets from a manipulative experiment testing forest resilience” by Jeff W. Atkins et al.

Joseph Stachelek (Referee)

stachel2@msu.edu

Received and published: 27 October 2020

1 General comments

The authors of this paper have done an excellent job following the principles of open data. They have quite thoroughly documented their data and made it readily available in a variety of archives. A real highlight of their efforts is the use of R package testing infrastructure for data validation. I also like how the authors have used minimal software dependencies in their package. This is something that likely increases the project's long-term value.

C1

2 Specific comments

Will the data size ever become unmanageable to ship with the package? The authors say they plan to submit the package to CRAN but the current package size (9mb) is larger than the CRAN limit of 5mb.

What is the planned data update frequency of fortedata? The authors say it will be updated as near-real time as possible. Is this likely to be annual, semi-annual, or some longer timestep?

L129: What is the approximate field season for the project?

I wish measurement units were embedded for all data columns. I see this is the case for `fd_inventory()$dbh_cm` but not `fd_soil_respiration$soil_co2_efflux`.

L211: A nice-to-have but certainly not required feature, a machine readable representation of the metadata associated with fortedata beyond the human readable manuscript.

Figures 3 and 5 are not referenced in the text.

Might want to add a URL and BugReports field to the DESCRIPTION file

3 Technical corrections

Abstract: I suggest using a different term for "level one data product" in the abstract or explaining it.

L24: ancillary measurements to help analyse and users analyse and interpret carbon cycling -> ancillary measurements to help users analyse and interpret carbon cycling

L43: This seems like an excessive number of citations for the preceding statement.

C2

