

Interactive comment on "Monitoring ephemeral, intermittent and perennial streamflow: A data set from 182 sites in the Attert catchment, Luxembourg" by Nils H. Kaplan et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 9 May 2019

General comments:

While there are plenty of datasets of time series with streamflow from permanent streams there is a need to address ephemeral and intermittent streams. This paper address this issue by presenting a novel dataset of presence and absence of stream flow within a 247 km 2 catchment in Luxembourg. The quality and time resolution of the dataset is high and the data can be used to evaluate hydrologic models.

Specific comments:

The introduction can be shortened and more focused on the methods used for this dataset.

C1

Bedrock, land use, climate and topography are well described. However a sentence Explaining the surface soils would be useful to list under site description.

The shapefile that contains the spatial data there are different attributes summarized within catchments. In order for someone else to work with this data it's important to have access to these catchments. I suggest that a description of how these catchments were extracted is included. Perhaps even upload the catchments along with the streamflow data.

I'm not clear on how exact the locations of the points are. Any estimate of GPS accuracy would help future users when delineating catchments or conducting hydrological modeling.

Technical corrections:

Minor comments on figure 1: North arrows are only required if the map is not north-oriented. It can be removed to clean up the look of figure 1.

Figure 4 and 5: in the figure legend dates are written 'year-month-day" but in the text it's written "day-month-year". Is this intentional?

Figure 6 description, bottom line: check spelling of "smaler". Should probably be "Smaller". Figure 6: The labels for proportion of sandstone is written horizontally while the labels for marls and slate are tilted. I suggest that you display all labels horizontally. Otherwise a neat figure.

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2019-54, 2019.