

# ***Interactive comment on “Monitoring ephemeral, intermittent and perennial streamflow: A data set from 182 sites in the Attert catchment, Luxembourg” by Nils H. Kaplan et al.***

## **Anonymous Referee #1**

Received and published: 16 April 2019

### General comments:

This paper describes the methods and logic behind an extensive data set that will be an important contribution to researchers studying intermittent and ephemeral streams. Understanding the conditions under which flow is initiated in streams and ditches, and are thus highly connected to their watersheds is an important field of research. Particularly, this study tests new methods against old methods and combines them to provide 182 monitored streams. This high-quality dataset will help many researchers test hydrological models of where and when streams flow, especially given different geology and topography.

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



## Specific comments:

Page 7, Lines 18-21: When I first read this I was very excited by the Image J plugin and thought that it classified all photos as streamflow or non-streamflow. But, later when I read the “Data quality and uncertainties” section (page 15, line 10), I realized that there were people involved in this evaluation. I think it would be good to make this point more clear. Rephrase as something like, “Pre-processed images were loaded as virtual stacks in to ImageJ and then visually classified by trained interpreters. . .”

## Technical corrections:

Page 7, line 12: In general, one should not start sentence with a number (“3” in this case), rather, spell out the word “Three” or restructure the sentence so that it does not begin with a number. – check this throughout the manuscript (i.e. page 11 there are a few).

Page 7, line 15: Super cool to have an Image J plugin! But. . . see specific comments above

Page 12, line 14: There is a period instead of a space after the (Pfister et al. 2017).

Page 15, lines 4-7: Typically, figures are referred to in their order of appearance. It is strange to jump from 8A to 8D. Please order them in the order you discuss them.

---

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2019-54>, 2019.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

