

## ***Interactive comment on “Exploring Geomorphic Processes and Martian Gale Crater Topography on Mars using CTX and HiRISE Express Image Dataset” by Pavan Kumar et al.***

**Giulio G.R. Iovine (Editor)**

g.iovine@irpi.cnr.it

Received and published: 20 March 2019

Based on the trail of reviews, comments, and responses, the manuscript ESSD-2019-4 suffers from serious flaws, both in scientific content and form. The Journal ESSD is devoted to the publication of new data concerning the planet Earth, rather than data interpretation. In this particular case, the discussed data even refer to another planetary body. The manuscript does not provide details on how to retrieve data from the NASA repository. The authors processed publicly available data, but neither produced nor shared an improved derived dataset of their own. The results of reviews recommended outright rejection in two of six cases during the public discussion phase. In addition,

C1

the manuscript has been criticized by the Mars research community. ESSD serves the earth system research community with high-quality data with potential for reuse. This manuscript fails to provide it and gives users neither hint nor guidance to the validity of the product. According to the above considerations, the editorial team recommends rejecting this manuscript.

---

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2019-4>, 2019.

C2