

## ***Interactive comment on “Exploring Geomorphic Processes and Martian Gale Crater Topography on Mars using CTX and HiRISE Express Image Dataset” by Pavan Kumar et al.***

**Giulio G.R. Iovine (Editor)**

g.iovine@irpi.cnr.it

Received and published: 3 March 2019

Allegations of plagiarism on manuscript ESSD-2019-4

The editors of ESSD received an email containing allegations of plagiarism on the manuscript ESSD-2019-4, entitled: “Exploring Geomorphic Processes and Martian Gale Crater Topography on Mars using CTX and HiRISE Express Image Dataset”, by Pavan Kumar and co-authors. The content of such email is included below. Authors and reviewers are strongly urged to pay attention to the content of such email, and to act accordingly: - the authors, to either provide exhaustive explanations or withdraw their manuscript; - the reviewers, to verify the actual “similarities” in the contents

C1

between the manuscript ESSD-2019-4 and the paper published in 2010 by Ryan B. Anderson and James F. Bell III (Geologic mapping and characterization of Gale Crater and implications for its potential as a Mars Science Laboratory landing site, Mars, doi: 10.1555/mars.2010.0004)

Please, note that - as all the manuscript received for publication in ESSD - even ESSD-2019-4 had automatically been checked to verify any plagiarism problem before starting the public discussion/review phase. The manuscript ESSD-2019-4 passed the test successfully: in fact, the iThenticate.com Similarity Report (completed on 18 Jan 2019), provided by Copernicus, stated that similarities were “negligible / not found”.

After discussing among the Editors and contacting the author of the email (who prefers to remain anonymous), I'm now posting the content of the email as the Handling Topical Editor to ensure editorial transparency and to allow for an adequate discussion on this matter. Many thanks to all for your attention and precious support. Giulio Iovine  
Handling Topical Editor ESSD

\*

The text of the received email follows:

<Dear Editors,

With due respect, I have a doubt regarding the novelty and originality of the manuscript entitled: 'Exploring Geomorphic Processes and Martian Gale Crater Topography on Mars using CTX and HiRISE Express Image Dataset' with doi: 10.5194/essd-2019-4.

Most of the findings in the paper seems a duplicate version of the paper published in the journal " Mars" in 2010 by Ryan B. Anderson and James F. Bell III. Title of the paper: 'Geologic mapping and characterization of Gale Crater and implications for its potential as a Mars Science Laboratory landing site' doi: doi:10.1555/mars.2010.0004

Although the authors [Kumar et al.; correspondence: Meenu Rani (meenu-rani06@gmail.com)] mentioned the reference of this paper, but I believe they have

C2

not not justified the use of the original work of Anderson and Bell (2010) and used it inappropriately. Only the mode of representation is a bit different with different colour schemes and views used in the figures of the ESSD paper, with similar findings as of the 'Mars' paper; the language being modified and without any result validation. However, the language of the ESSD paper is erroneous too. Findings from other papers are also included, but mostly from Anderson and Bell (2010). I am enclosing both the manuscripts for your ready reference. Kindly check as I might be wrong too, but I have full faith in your intelligence and decisions. The rest I leave it to your wisdom and your fine sense of judgment.

Regards.>

---

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2019-4>, 2019.