



Increased nitrogen enrichment and shifted patterns in the world's grassland: 1860-2014

Rongting Xu¹, Hanqin Tian^{1,2}, Shufen Pan¹, Shree R. S. Dangal^{3,1}, Jian Chen^{4,1}, Jinfeng Chang⁵, Yonglong Lu², Ute Maria Skiba⁶ and Bowen Zhang¹

¹International Center for Climate and Global Change Research and School of Forestry and Wildlife Sciences, Auburn University, Auburn, AL 36849, USA

²Research Center for Eco-Environmental Sciences, State Key Laboratory of Urban and Regional

Ecology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100085, China

³Woods Hole Research Center, Falmouth, Massachusetts 02540, USA

⁴Department of Computer Science and Software Engineering, Samuel Ginn College of

Engineering, Auburn University, Auburn, AL 36849, USA

⁵Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement, LSCE, 91191 Gif sur Yvette, France

⁶Centre for Ecology and Hydrology, Bush Estate, Penicuik EH26 0QB, United Kingdom;

Correspondence to: Dr. Hanqin Tian (tianhan@auburn.edu)





1 Abstract

2	As the largest sector on the Earth's land surface, the livestock system is not only a major
3	contributor to global manure excreta that perturbs the global nutrient balance, but also a major
4	emitter of greenhouse gases that warms the climate. Much attention has been paid to nitrogen (N)
5	fertilizer and manure N applications to global croplands, however, there is still a lack of
6	spatially-explicit estimates of continuous time-series datasets of manure and fertilizer N inputs in
7	global grasslands. In this study, we therefore developed three global gridded datasets at a
8	resolution of $0.5^{\circ} \times 0.5^{\circ}$ for the period 1860–2014 (i.e., annual manure N deposition rate,
9	synthetic N fertilizer use rate, and manure N application rate) by combining annual and 5-arc
10	minute spatial data on pasture and rangeland with country-level manure and synthetic fertilizer N
11	data from the Food and Agricultural Organization database (FAOSTAT). We found that total N
12	inputs, sum of manure N deposition, manure and fertilizer N application to global grassland
13	systems increased from 15.5 to 103.8 Tg N yr ⁻¹ during 1860–2014. Manure N deposition
14	accounted for 83.7% of the total N inputs, whereas manure and fertilizer N application accounted
15	for 7.7% and 8.6%, respectively, during 2000–2014. At the regional scale, hotspots of manure N
16	deposition remained the same during 1860-2014 (i.e., southern Asia, Africa, and South
17	America), but hotspots of manure and fertilizer N application have shifted from Europe to
18	southern Asia in the early 21st century. These three datasets could fill data gaps of N inputs in
19	global and regional grasslands and serve as input drivers for ecosystem and biogeochemistry
20	models to investigate the impacts of N enrichment on the global grassland system, greenhouse
21	gas emissions, and environmental sustainability. Datasets available at
22	https://doi.pangaea.de/10.1594/PANGAEA.892940.

23 Keywords: nitrogen, manure, synthetic nitrogen fertilizer, global grassland systems





24 1 Introduction

25 Livestock production has increased substantially in response to growing meat consumption across the globe in the past century (Bouwman et al., 2013). The livestock sector, which 26 predominantly covers grassland systems, occupies 30% of Earth's ice-free land surface and 27 28 accounts for 33%-50% of the world's agricultural gross domestic products (Herrero et al., 2013). 29 While the livestock sector is a major source of income for more than 1.3 billion people globally, 30 it is also a major user of crop products and freshwater resources (Dangal et al., 2017; Herrero et al., 2013). Thus, the expansion of this sector plays a significant role in land-use changes and 31 32 global nutrient cycles (Havlík et al., 2014; Herrero et al., 2013). There is a growing recognition 33 that the livestock sector has caused increasing greenhouse gases (GHGs) and ammonia emissions, severe pollution of aquatic systems, and degradation of soil properties at the site-, regional-, and 34 global-scale (Dangal et al., 2017; Davidson, 2009; Davis et al., 2015; Oenema et al., 2005; Tian 35 36 et al., 2016; Valin et al., 2013). The growing demand for livestock products has strengthened the 37 reliance on grains for feed and has led to an increase in manure and fertilizer N use in croplands and consequently increased GHG emissions and other air-polluting gases (e.g., ammonia, nitric 38 39 oxide) (Bouwman et al., 2013; Davis et al., 2015; Xu et al., 2018).

Livestock systems play an important role in global nutrient cycles. For example, nitrogen production from animal manure has increased from 21.4 Tg N yr⁻¹ in 1860 to 131.0 Tg N yr⁻¹ in 2014 (FAOSTAT, 2016; Zhang et al., 2017). Livestock contribute 80% to all non-CO₂ GHG emissions from the agricultural sector, among which CH₄ emissions account for 47%–54% (Dangal et al., 2017; Tubiello et al., 2013). In addition, manure deposited through grazing and manure applied to croplands and pasture account for ~45% of total anthropogenic N₂O emissions (Davidson, 2009). Globally emissions from manure N applied to soils or left on pastures has





increased from 0.44 to 0.88 GtCO₂eq yr⁻¹ during 1961–2010 (Tubiello et al., 2013), and our
desire for meat plays an important part in the atmospheric increase of N₂O and CH₄ (Bouwman
et al., 2013; Dangal et al., 2017).

50 A number of studies have focused on developing regional and global datasets of nitrogen fertilizer and livestock manure production to understand their feedback on the climate system. 51 The datasets of N fertilizer use were provided and annually updated by previous studies 52 53 (Bouwman et al., 2005; FAOSTAT, 2016; Lu and Tian, 2017; Mueller et al., 2012; Nishina et al., 2017; Potter et al., 2010; Sheldrick et al., 2002). Further, global manure production datasets were 54 55 developed in different studies to achieve various research goals (Bouwman et al., 2009; 56 Bouwman et al., 2013; Holland et al.; Potter et al., 2010; Zhang et al., 2017). In addition, although datasets of manure application in croplands are becoming increasingly available, there 57 58 is considerable uncertainty in the estimation of total manure application and their spatial distribution across different studies (Gerber et al., 2016; Herrero et al., 2013; Liu et al., 2010; 59 Zhang et al., 2017). 60

61 Although previous studies have provided spatially explicit datasets of N inputs in the form of mineral and manure N in cropland systems, the spatially explicit datasets on N inputs in 62 grassland systems are still missing (Hauglustaine, 2016; Lassaletta et al., 2014; Stehfest and 63 Bouwman, 2006). The FAOSTAT database provides country-level manure and fertilizer N 64 65 amounts on grasslands; however, directly using such datasets by process-based global biogeochemistry models may not fully investigate spatial pattern changes within countries. To 66 enhance our understanding of the role of grassland systems on the overall global GHG balance, 67 global biogeochemistry models require spatially explicit estimates of N inputs. In this study, 68 according to grassland N inputs datasets provided by FAOSTAT (2016), we developed datasets 69





- for major sources of N inputs in grassland systems (manure and fertilizer application on pastures,
- 71 and manure deposition on grasslands).
- 72 Through combining the land-use dataset HYDE 3.2 (Klein Goldewijk, 2017) and country-level manure and fertilizer database (FAOSTAT, 2016), we developed three gridded time-series 73 datasets at a resolution of $0.5^{\circ} \times 0.5^{\circ}$ for (1) manure N application to pastures (1860–2014), (2) 74 N fertilizer application to pastures (1961–2014), and (3) manure deposition by grazing livestock 75 to rangelands and pastures (1860–2014). We quantified regional variations in N inputs, identified 76 77 hotspots of N inputs from different N sources in grassland systems, and discussed their uncertainty. These datasets are developed for global model simulation studies in model inter-78 79 comparison projects (e.g., NMIP; Tian et al., 2018), and will be updated annually based on the 80 newest released country-level database in FAOSTAT and land-use datasets.

81 2 Methods

82 2.1 The categories of grasslands

Globally, grassland systems are defined as areas dominated by herbaceous and shrub vegetation, 83 84 which includes savannas (Africa, South America and India), steppes (Eurasia), prairies (North 85 America), shrub-dominated areas (Africa), meadows and pastures (United Kingdom and Ireland) and tundra (Breymeyer, 1990; White et al., 2000). In this study, we follow the definition of the 86 FAO categories, and grasslands are pastures and rangelands. In general, pastures are managed to 87 88 support high stocking densities of grass production for hay/silage, whereas rangelands are unmanaged and grazed at low stocking densities. The spatial distribution map of pastures and 89 rangelands used were provided by the land-use dataset HYDE 3.2 (Klein Goldewijk, 2017). To 90 91 investigate N inputs in regional grasslands, the global landmass was disaggregated into seven





- 92 regions: North America, South America, Africa, Europe, southern Asia (i.e., west, south, east,
- 93 central and southeast Asia), northern Asia, and Oceania (Fig. S1).
- 94 2.2 Fertilizer N application on global pastures

We obtained national-level datasets of "synthetic N fertilizer consumption" from FAOSTAT 95 database during 1961-2014. However, this dataset included N fertilizer application amounts in 96 97 both croplands and pastures. To separate N fertilizer application on pastures from croplands, we adopted the ratio of N use on pastures to total N amount in 151 countries from Lassaletta et al. 98 99 (2014) even though the ratio in some countries is zero. Then, combining the land-use data 100 (pastures) from HYDE 3.2, we spatialized the national-level N fertilizer application amounts to gridded maps of application rates in each grid cell area during 1961-2014 (Fig. 1). The 101 102 application rate was the same within each country but different across countries because ratios of 103 N use on pastures were available only at the country level.

104 2.3 Manure N deposition to global grasslands

To develop global distribution maps of manure deposition (aka manure left on pastures and 105 rangelands), we first obtained country-level datasets of "manure left on pastures" from the 106 FAOSTAT database during 1961–2014. We then obtained the national-level ratio of manure 107 deposition to production $(R_{d2p_{y,i}})$ by combining country-level FAO datasets of "manure left on 108 pastures" and gridded total manure production datasets based on Zhang et al. (2017). Then, we 109 110 used spatial distributions of global grasslands including rangelands and pastures based on HYDE 3.2 (Klein Goldewijk, 2017) and gridded maps of deposition rates, to spatialize the national-level 111 manure N deposition at the global scale. For example, we multiplied the $R_{d2p_{y,i}}$ ratio in grids 112 within which the grassland (pastures and rangelands) area was larger than zero, with the time-113





series gridded spatial distribution maps of manure production rates in Zhang et al. (2017) during

116 The above-mentioned processes are represented by the following equations:

117
$$R_{d2p_{y,j}} = \frac{T_{Mdep_{y,j}}}{\sum_{g=1}^{g=n\,in\,country\,j}(R_{Mprody,g} \times A_g)}$$
(1)

where year (y) is from 1961 to 2014 and country number (*j*) is 158. $R_{d2p_{y,j}}$ is the ratio (unitless) of manure deposition to production in the year y and country *j*. $T_{Mdep_{y,j}}$ is national total manure deposition amount (kg N yr⁻¹) derived from the FAO database for each year. $R_{Mprod_{y,g}}$ is the gridded manure N production rate (kg N km⁻² yr⁻¹) in the year y and grid g. A_g is the area of each grid (km²).

123
$$R_{Mdep_{y,g}} = R_{d2p_{y,j}} \times R_{Mprod_{y,g}}$$
(2)

where $R_{Mdep_{y,g}}$ is the gridded manure deposition rate (kg N km⁻² yr⁻¹) in the year y and country *j*. Finally, we calculated the manure deposition amount for each country through combining $R_{Mdep_{y,g}}$ and grid area to compare with the national-level deposition amounts from the FAOSTAT database, using the following equation:

128
$$CT_{Mdep_{y,j}} = \sum_{g=1}^{g=n \text{ in country } j} (R_{Mdep_{y,g}} \times A_g)$$
(3)

where $CT_{Mdep_{y,j}}$ (kg N yr⁻¹) is the calculated national-level manure deposition amount in the year y and country j. If $CT_{Mdep_{y,j}}$ is less or more than $T_{Mdep_{y,j}}$, an adjustment was made to keep calculated national total amounts consistent with those from the FAOSTAT database. In this case, $CT_{Mdep_{y,j}}$ is roughly equal to $T_{Mdep_{y,j}}$ using Eq. 3, thus no adjustment was needed.





Since the national-level manure deposition amounts are not available during 1860–1960, we assumed that $R_{d2p_{y,j}}$ is the same as that in 1961. Combining the gridded spatial maps of manure production rates in Zhang et al. (2017), we generated datasets of spatialized manure deposition rates on global grasslands during 1860–1960.

137 2.4 Manure N application to global pastures

138 We obtained country-level datasets of "manure applied to soils" from the FAOSTAT database 139 during 1961–2014. However, the FAOSTAT database did not provide the percentage of annual total manure application amount to pastures and data of manure N application rates to pastures 140 141 are currently not available. We therefore assumed that manure N application rates in pastures and 142 croplands were the same. Through combining land-use data HYDE 3.2, we calculated the total cropland and pasture areas within each country where manure application amount was larger 143 144 than zero. We then extracted national-level manure N application amounts to pastures during 145 1961-2014 (Fig. 2).

We calculated the national-level ratio of manure application to production $(R_{a2p_{y,j}})$ by combining gridded manure production data in Zhang et al. (2017) and the grid cell area. To spatialize the national-level manure N application amounts to gridded maps of application rates in each grid area, we multiplied the $R_{a2p_{y,j}}$ in grids where pasture areas were larger than zero with the time-series gridded spatial distribution maps of manure production rate in Zhang et al. (2017) during 1961–2014 and based on the spatial distributions of global pastures in land-use data HYDE 3.2 (Klein Goldewijk et al., 2017).

153 The above-mentioned processes are represented by following equations:





154

$$R_{a2p_{y,j}} = \frac{T_{Mapp_{y,j}}}{\sum_{g=1}^{g=n\,in\,country\,j}(R_{Mprod_{y,g}} \times A_g)}$$
(4)

where year is from 1961 to 2014, and country number is 202. $R_{a2p_{y,j}}$ is the ratio (unitless) of manure application to production in the year *y* and country *j*. $T_{Mapp_{y,j}}$ is the national total manure application amount (kg N yr⁻¹) derived from the FAO database for each year.

$$R_{Mapp_{y,g}} = R_{a2p_{y,j}} \times R_{Mprod_{y,g}}$$
(5)

159 where $R_{Mapp_{y,g}}$ is the gridded manure application rate (kg N km⁻² yr⁻¹) in year y and country j.

As the national-level manure application amount was not available during 1860–1960, we assumed that $R_{a2p_{y,j}}$ is the same as for 1961. Combining with the gridded spatial maps of manure production rates in Zhang et al. (2017), we generated the datasets of spatialized manure application rates to global pastures during 1860–1960.

Finally, we calculated manure application amounts in each country by combining $R_{Mapp_{y,g}}$ and grid areas to compare with national-level deposition amounts from the FAOSTAT database during 1961–2014. As we calculated national-level manure application amounts during 1860–1960 using $R_{a2p_{y,j}}$ in 1961, these data served as national total manure N application amounts to adjust $R_{Mapp_{y,g}}$ during 1860–1960.

169 The adjustment procedure is represented in the following equations:

170
$$CT_{Mapp_{y,j}} = \sum_{g=1}^{g=n \text{ in country } j} (R_{Mapp_{y,g}} \times A_g)$$
(6)

where year is from 1860–2014. $CT_{Mapp_{y,j}}$ (kg N yr⁻¹) is the calculated national-level manure application amounts in the year y and country j. If $CT_{Mapp_{y,j}}$ is less or more than $T_{Mapp_{y,j}}$, an





- adjustment is needed to keep calculated national total amounts consistent with amounts from the
- 174 FAOSTAT database. In this case, $CT_{Mdep_{y,j}}$ is less than $T_{Mdep_{y,j}}$ using Eq. 6, thus an adjustment
- is needed, using the following equations:

176
$$R_{a_{y,j}} = \frac{T_{Mapp_{y,j}}}{CT_{Mapp_{y,j}}}$$
(7)

177 where $R_{a_{y,j}}$ is the regulation ratio (unitless) in the year y and country j.

178
$$R_{Mapp_{y,g}(r)} = R_{Mapp_{y,g}} \times R_{a_{y,j}}$$
(8)

where $R_{Mapp_{y,g(r)}}$ is real gridded manure application rate (kg N km⁻² yr⁻¹) in the year y and country *j*.

181 **3 Results**

182 3.1 Fertilizer N application to pastures during 1961–2014

Our results showed that the total amount of N fertilizer applied to pastures increased from 0.05 to 8.50 Tg N yr⁻¹ during 1961–2014 at an increasing rate of ~0.18 Tg N yr⁻¹ ($R^2 = 0.98$) per year (Fig. 3a). Synthetic N fertilizer application rates showed rapid increases across the globe and exhibited large spatial variations during the study period (Fig. 4b-c). The global average application rate was 0.07 kg N ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹ in 1961 and reached 10.67 kg N ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹ in 2014 (increased ~151 folds) (Table 1).

In the 1960s, Europe (0.2 Tg N yr⁻¹) was the largest contributor (68.4%) to the total global N fertilizer use, followed by North America (0.06 Tg N yr⁻¹, 21.3%) and southern Asia (0.03 Tg N yr⁻¹, 10%) (Fig. 5a). The remaining regions accounted for less than 5% of the total N fertilizer application. During 1961–2014, southern Asia showed a continuous increase of N fertilizer





193 consumption and became the largest contributor (3.3 Tg N yr⁻¹, 45%) between 2000 and 2014. 194 In contrast, Europe's N fertilizer use and contribution to the global total had decreased since the 195 1980s (Fig. 5a). During 2000–2014, Europe applied 2 Tg N yr⁻¹ which accounted for 28% of the 196 total global N fertilizer use. There was a slight increase in the contribution from North America, 197 and the fertilizer N use amount increased by 1.5 Tg N yr⁻¹. The remaining regions accounted for 198 roughly 6% of the total N fertilizer application.

199 We identified the top 5 countries (India, United States, China, France, and Germany) with highest fertilizer N consumption in 2014. These countries consumed 48.7% to 61.5% of the total 200 N fertilizer from 1961 to 2014. India (1.6 Tg N yr⁻¹) and the United States (1.5 Tg N yr⁻¹) were 201 the two largest contributors in 2014, at an increasing rate of 46.7 Gg N yr⁻¹ ($R^2 = 0.98$) per year 202 during 1980–2014 and 31.1 Gg N yr⁻¹ ($R^2 = 0.99$) per year during 1961–2014, respectively. 203 China consumed 1.2 Tg N yr⁻¹ in 2014 at an increasing rate of 32.4 Gg N yr⁻¹ ($R^2 = 0.96$) per 204 205 year during 1977–2014 while there was only a slight increase during 1961–1976. In contrast, fertilizer N use in France peaked in 1999 (0.76 Tg N yr⁻¹), then showed a rapid decrease until 206 2014 (0.52 Tg N yr⁻¹). Similarly, in Germany, it peaked in 1987 (0.76 Tg N yr⁻¹), and showed a 207 continuous decrease until 2014 (0.36 Tg N yr⁻¹). 208

3.2 Manure N application during 1860–2014

Our results showed that the annual manure N use on global pastures increased from 1.4 to 8.5 Tg N yr⁻¹ during 1860–2014 (Fig. 3a). Manure N application rates showed rapid increases across the globe and exhibited large spatial variations, shifting from the western to eastern world, during the study period (Fig. 4d-f). The global average manure application rate was 5.3 kg N ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹ in 1860 and roughly doubled by 2014 (10.72 kg N ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹) (Table 1).





From the regional perspective (Fig. 5b), Europe $(0.79 \text{ Tg N yr}^{-1})$ acted as the largest contributor 215 and accounted for 51.6%, while southern Asia (0.26 Tg N yr⁻¹) accounted for 17.1% of the global 216 total manure N application in the 1860s. South and North America shared the same proportion 217 (12.6%), whereas the remaining regions only shared 5.5%. During 2000–2014, manure N 218 application in southern Asia (3.0 Tg N yr⁻¹) was tenfold higher than that in the 1860s and 219 accounted for 36.3% of global total manure N application. In contrast, Europe was surpassed by 220 southern Asia and accounted for 27.6% of the global total manure N use. Manure N application 221 222 amounts in North America and South America increased, but with different magnitudes. During 223 2000–2014, North America accounted for 11.2%, while South America accounted for 17.0% of 224 the global total. In the remaining regions significant increases of annual manure N application 225 amounts also occurred, but their contributions to global total manure N use changed only slightly (7.9%) compared to the 1860s. 226

227 In 2014, the top 5 countries with largest manure N application amounts were China, United 228 States, Brazil, Russia, and France. Manure N application in these countries contributed 43.7% to 53.7% of global total use amounts from 1961 to 2014. China (2.6 Tg N yr⁻¹) alone accounted for 229 30.8% in 2014 at an increasing rate of 0.04 Tg N yr⁻¹ ($R^2 = 0.98$) per year during 1961–2014. 230 Manure N use in Brazil and the United States was 0.73 and 0.63 Tg N yr⁻¹, respectively, in 2014. 231 Both countries showed a slower increasing trend (Brazil: 7.5 and United States: 2.8 Gg N yr⁻¹ per 232 year) during 1961-2014. In contrast, Russian manure N application peaked in 1990 (0.7 Tg N yr⁻ 233 ¹), then showed a rapid decrease until 2014 (0.31 Tg N yr⁻¹). Similarly, in France, it peaked in 234 1978 (0.45 Tg N yr⁻¹), then showed a continuous decrease until 2014 (0.28 Tg N yr⁻¹). 235

236 3.3 Manure N deposition during 1860–2014





Our results showed that the total amounts increased from 14.1 to 86.7 Tg N yr⁻¹ during 1860–2014 (Fig. 3b). Manure N deposition rates increased steeply across the globe, but exhibited large spatial variations during the study period (Fig. 4g-i). The increase was much larger in the eastern world (typically China and India) and South America compared to the western world. The global average manure deposition rate was 11.27 kg N ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹ in 1860 and reached 26.3 kg N ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹ in 2014 (Table 1).

243 At the regional scale (Fig. 5c), southern Asia was the region with largest manure N deposition (4.4 Tg N yr⁻¹; 29.8% of total manure N deposition amounts), followed by Africa (2.8 Tg N yr⁻¹; 244 18.6%) and South America (2.4 Tg N yr⁻¹; 16.5%) in the 1860s. Manure N deposition in the 245 remaining regions was estimated to be 5.2 Tg N yr⁻¹, contributing 35.1% to the total manure N 246 deposition amount. During 2000-2014, southern Asia, Africa, and South America were still the 247 three largest contributors: 27.6 Tg N yr⁻¹ accounted for 34.5%, 21.2 Tg N yr⁻¹ accounted for 248 26.4%, and 15.6 Tg N yr⁻¹ accounted for 19.6% of the global manure N deposition, respectively. 249 250 The remaining regions (Oceania, North America, and Europe) contributed to 19.5% of the global 251 total during 2000-2014. Europe and Oceania experienced an increase in manure deposition amounts from 1860 to 1960, but since 1980 there was a significant decrease. Manure N 252 deposition amounts in North America increased during 1860-1980, but changed slightly since 253 1960. 254

In this study, we identified the top 10 countries (China, Brazil, India, Ethiopia PDR, United States, Australia, Sudan (former), Pakistan, Argentina, and Nigeria) that together contributed to 52% of the global total manure N deposition to grasslands in 2014. Among these countries, China (20%) and Brazil (20%) were the two largest contributors, with the same annual rate of increase of 0.1 Tg N yr⁻¹ ($R^2 = 0.99$) per year during 1961–2014. India was the third largest





contributor, however, at a smaller increasing rate of 0.06 Tg N yr⁻¹ ($R^2 = 0.98$) per year during 260 1961-2014. Annual manure N deposition in Ethiopia PDR was stable during 1961-2000, but 261 since then rapidly increased at a rate of 0.1 Tg N yr⁻¹ ($R^2 = 0.96$) per year. The United States 262 263 showed a significant increase of annual manure N deposition from 1961 to 1975 and then was stable after 1980. Australia showed a decreasing trend during 1990–2014 at a rate of 0.06 Tg N 264 yr^{-1} ($R^2 = 0.91$) per year, whereas, in the former Sudan, Pakistan, and Nigeria annual manure N 265 deposition amounts to grasslands increased at an annual average rate of 0.07 ($R^2 = 0.8$), 0.05 (R^2 266 = 0.97), 0.06 ($R^2 = 0.98$) Tg N yr⁻¹ per year, respectively. There was no significant change in 267 manure N deposition amounts in Argentina; the annual from 1961 to 2014 was 2.58 Tg N yr⁻¹. 268

269 4 Discussion

4.1 Overview of global N inputs to grasslands

271 The global N cycle has been altered by human perturbation since the industrial revolution. Intense agricultural activities, such as land use change, N fertilizer input, and intensive livestock 272 rearing play an important part in these changes. However, little attention has been paid to 273 estimate global N inputs to grassland systems and consequences on N₂O emissions (Galloway et 274 275 al., 2008; Tian et al., 2016; Xu et al., 2017). In this study, we have generated datasets of N input 276 to grassland systems during 1860-2014. Pastures and rangelands have experienced substantial 277 land expansion over the period of 1860–1998, thereafter this increase has slowed down (Klein 278 Goldewijk, 2017). The total amount of mineral and manure N applied to grasslands had increased by 570%, from 15.5 to 103.8 Tg N yr⁻¹ from 1860 to 2014. During 2000-2014, the 279 global mineral N fertilizer application in agricultural systems was estimated at 95 Tg N yr⁻¹ 280 (FAOSTAT, 2016), and manure production was 122 Tg N yr⁻¹ (Zhang et al., 2017), resulting in a 281





- total reactive N production of 217 Tg N yr⁻¹. Our estimate of total N inputs to grasslands (96 Tg
- N yr⁻¹) accounted for 44% of global total N applied to agricultural systems during 2000–2014.
- 4.2 Improvements beyond FAOSTAT datasets

The original national-level synthetic N fertilizer and manure application/deposition datasets were 285 downloaded from the FAOSTAT database. Our work took a step further in order to provide input 286 287 drivers for process-based model simulations (e.g., N₂O-MIP, Tian et al., 2018). FAOSTAT mainly provides data of synthetic N fertilizer application amounts for agricultural use. In our 288 dataset we have separated rates of N application to pastures from other agricultural activities for 289 290 each country for the period 1961 to 2014, based on the percentage provided by Lassaletta et al. 291 (2014). FAOSTAT only provides a total amount of national-level manure N application to soils 292 starting with the year 1961. Our study extended this dataset by providing spatialized manure N 293 application rates to pastures and spatialized national-level manure N deposition dataset from 1860 to 2014. 294

4.3 Comparison with other studies

296 We compared our datasets with other existing data sources (Table 2). Our estimate of manure N 297 use on global pastures was 58% and 171% higher than that estimated by Stehfest & Bouwman 298 (2006) and Liu et al. (2010), respectively. However, our estimate was 39% and 87% lower than estimates by Bouwman et al. (2002 and 2013, respectively). Pasture areas varied significantly 299 300 across different studies. For example, Bowman et al. (2013) divided grasslands into mixed and 301 pastoral systems and their grassland area was calculated based on the country- or regional-level grazing intensity (Table 2). In addition, synthetic fertilizers were applied to the area of mixed 302 303 agricultural systems (grassland and cropland) and manure N was assumed to be applied to both





mixed and pastoral systems. The HYDE 3.2 land use dataset divides the global grazing area into
intensively managed (pastures), less intensive and unmanaged grasslands (rangelands) (Klein
Goldewijk et al., 2017). In this study, we assumed that all manure N was applied to pastures (798
Mha). Hence, pasture area defined in Bowman et al. (2013) was more than fourfold higher than
the data we used. Consequently, the spatial distribution and annual total N application differed
substantially compared with that in Bowman et al. (2013).

310 Similarly, the estimates of N fertilizer use in grassland systems showed large variations across 311 studies (Table 1). In this study, we obtained country-level N fertilizer amounts applied to grasslands from the national-level ratios provided by Lassaletta et al. (2014) and total N amounts 312 applied to soils including grasslands and croplands provided by FAOSTAT. Thus, the global N 313 fertilizer amount in 2000 was consistent with that in Lassaletta et al. (2014). Liu et al. (2010) 314 assumed that 16% of fertilizer was applied to global grasslands. Their estimate was roughly 315 twice as high as this study (6.3 Tg N yr⁻¹) for the year 2000. The estimates by Bowman et al. 316 317 (2002) and Stehfest & Bouwman (2006) were 29% and 55%, respectively, lower than our estimates in the corresponding years. Klein Goldewijk et al. (2017) divided land used for grazing 318 into more intensively used pastures, less intensively used or unmanaged rangelands. In this study, 319 we assumed N fertilizer was applied to all global pastures and therefore the total area of 320 321 intensively managed grassland was significantly different from the area used in Bowman et al. (2002) and Chang et al. (2016). 322

323 4.4 Changes in N inputs hotspots

Overall, southern Asia ranks as a top hotspot of all sources of global N inputs in grassland systems during the past three decades, causing a major threat to environmental sustainability and human health in this region. In the 1860's overall manure N production amounts were similar in





327 Asia and Europe (Zhang et al., 2017). However, manure N deposition was 2.4 times higher than 328 that in Europe, whereas manure N application was three times lower than that in Europe. During 329 2000-2014, southern Asia accounted for ~42% of global manure N production. Consequently, 330 manure N deposition and application amounts in southern Asia were the highest compared to the rest of the regions between 2000-2014. These increases are due to large increases in animal 331 numbers (e.g., cattle, sheep and goats) since 1950 (Bouwman et al., 2013; Dangal et al., 2017). 332 For the rest of the regions, the increases of livestock numbers were also found in South America 333 and Africa since 1860, whereas livestock numbers in Europe and North America showed a 334 decreasing trend after 1980 (Dangal et al., 2017). Thus, besides southern Asia, South America 335 336 and Africa were hotspots for manure N deposition during 1860-2014, while manure N deposition amount decreased in Europe and North America since the 1980s. 337

338 4.4.1 Shifting hotspots of N fertilizer application

European countries (e.g., Germany, United Kingdom, and Ireland) were identified as top hotspots of global N fertilizer application in 1961 (Fig. 4b). However, these hotspots have shifted from Western Europe towards southern Asia at the end of the 20th century (Fig. 4c). Southern Asia was found with the highest N fertilizer application amounts between 2000 and 2014, most concentrated in countries of East and South Asia (e.g., China and India). China and India together applied 32.5% of global total N fertilizer to grasslands.

345 4.4.2 Shifting hotspots of manure N application

Manure application hotspots moved from European countries to southern Asia during the past 155 years. Between 1860 and 1999, Europe accounted for 50% of global total manure N application to grasslands and experienced a rapid growth of manure N application, peaked (3.5





- 349 Tg N yr⁻¹) in 1986. In 1860, the highest applications were in the United Kingdom, France, and
- 350 Germany (Fig. 4d), but by 2014, the highest application was in the North China Plain (Fig. 4f).
- 351 China alone applied 30% of global total manure N during 2000–2014.
- 352 4.4.3 Shifted hotspots in manure N deposition

353 Southern Asia, as the hotspot of manure N deposition to grasslands, contributed 31% of the 354 global total amount during the past 155 years. Also, in Africa and South America substantial 355 increases of manure N deposition during 1860-2014 were observed. In the 1860s, manure N deposition from southern Asia, Africa, and South America contributed to 65%, whereas Europe 356 accounted only for 13% of the global total manure N deposition. In 1860, the highest deposition 357 rates were observed for New Zealand, Australia, and Western Europe (Fig. 4g). In 2014, except 358 for the above-mentioned regions, the highest deposition rates were in South and West Asia, 359 360 China, West and East Africa, and South America (Fig. 4i). During 2000-2014, manure N 361 deposition from southern Asia, Africa, and South America contributed to 80%, while Europe accounted for 5% of the global total amount. 362

363 4.5 Uncertainties

This study attempts to provide an overall estimate of N inputs to global rangelands and pastures, during the period 1860–2014. However, before these data are used in global models, uncertainties of these datasets need to be addressed. First, the different definitions of grassland systems used by the scientific community introduce uncertainties of the spatial patterns and annual total amounts of N inputs. Chang et al. (2016) generated global maps of grassland management intensity since 1901 based on modeled net primary production and the use of grass biomass generated by Herrero et al. (2013). Their total grassland area substantially differed from





371 pasture area developed by HYDE 3.1 (Chang et al., 2016). In this study, we used HYDE 3.2 to 372 generate N inputs to global grasslands. This dataset exactly followed the FAOSTAT data during 373 1960-2015, and combined population density data to reconstruct land use prior to 1960. Pastures 374 and rangelands defined in HYDE 3.2 were based on the intensity of human management. 375 Although Bouwman et al. (2013) indicated that grassland areas in their study were also calculated based on the grazing intensity, their total area (pastures and rangelands) and spatial 376 patterns were obviously different from HYDE 3.2 (Table 2). Thus, a better understanding of land 377 378 use is vital to reduce the uncertainty of estimating N input rates and amounts in grasslands. 379 Second, the FAOSTAT database provides the country-level manure N applied to soils; however, this dataset could not be directly applied to study N cycles on pastures since all N were applied 380 to both cropland and pasture soils. In this study, it remains large uncertainty that we separated 381 382 national-level manure N application on pastures simply based on pasture area over total 383 agricultural area (pastures and croplands). In previous studies, Bouwman et al. (2013) assumed 384 that 50% and only 5% of the available manure was applied to grasslands in most industrialized countries and in most developing countries, respectively. Liu et al. (2010) allocated 34% of the 385 national total solid manure to pastures in European countries and Canada, 13% of the national 386 total manure to pastures in the United States, and 10% of the national total manure to pastures in 387 developing countries. Chang et al. (2016) assumed that manure N application rate changes along 388 with changes in the total ruminant stocking density. Moreover, the spatialization process of N 389 application rates might introduce large uncertainty. The spatial pattern of gridded manure N 390 application rates in our study are correlated with manure production rates in Zhang et al. (2017). 391 The assumptions and uncertainties mentioned in their study, such as without considering 392 livestock migration, might cause uncertainty of spatial distribution. Third, studies used different 393





394 data sources and made various assumptions of the annual amount of fertilizer N applied on 395 global pastures (Bouwman et al., 2002; Stehfest and Bouwman, 2006; Chang et al., 2016; Liu et 396 al., 2009; Lassaletta et al., 2014). Thus, there remains large uncertainty of total N application on global grasslands. Moreover, N fertilizer application rates by crops were highly investigated and 397 documented in previous studies. Hence, N fertilizer application datasets were generated 398 399 considering crop-specific fertilizer rates and cropland area in each grid (Potter et al., 2010; 400 Mueller et al., 2012; Nishina et al., 2017; Lu and Tian, 2017). In reality, N fertilizer application on pastures of each country is not even. In this study, we assumed that N fertilizer application 401 402 rate in each country was constant, which means fertilizer was applied evenly in each grid with 403 pastures area larger than zero.

Furthermore, other human-induced sources of N inputs to global grasslands were not included in 404 our study, which may underestimate total N received by global grassland systems. For example, 405 biological N fixation was one of the major N sources in the terrestrial ecosystem in the absence 406 of human influence (Cleveland et al., 1999). Grassland system occupies 30% of the Earth's ice-407 free land surface across different latitudes with divergent biological N fixation abilities. Plant 408 production in temperate grasslands is proximately limited by N supply due to little N via N 409 fixation; however, tropical savannah received a large amount of N through leguminous species 410 411 (Cleveland et al., 1999; Vitousek et al., 2013). An estimate of potential N fixation amount by global grassland systems is ~46.5 Tg N yr⁻¹, with a range of 26.6–66.5 Tg N yr⁻¹ (Cleveland et al., 412 413 1999). Atmospheric N deposition is another major source of N input to global grassland system and increased from 2.0 to 13.7 Tg N yr⁻¹ for the period 1860-2014 based on the Chemistry-414 Climate Model Initiative N deposition fields (Eyring et al., 2013; Tian et al., 2018). 415





417 **5 Data availability**

The $0.5^{\circ} \times 0.5^{\circ}$ gridded global datasets of manure nitrogen deposition, manure nitrogen application, and nitrogen fertilizer application in grassland systems are available at https://doi.pangaea.de/10.1594/PANGAEA.892940 (Xu et al., 2018). Data are in ASCII format. A supplemental file is added to the list of all other parameters used in this study to calculate these three datasets in global grassland systems.

423 **6 Conclusion**

424 In the context of increasing livestock production, manure and fertilizer N inputs to the global grassland system have increased rapidly since the industrial revolution. However, datasets of 425 global N inputs in grasslands are still missing. This is the first study that has attempted to 426 427 consider major sources of anthropogenic N inputs in grassland systems and hence generated time-series gridded datasets of manure and fertilizer N application rates, and manure deposition 428 rate during 1860-2014. Our datasets indicated a rapid increase of total N inputs to global 429 grasslands during this period, especially the past half century. The hotspots of grassland N 430 application shifted from European countries to southern Asia, specifically China and India 431 during 1860–2014, which indicated the spatial transformation of environmental problems. In this 432 study, we have obtained N data from various sources to fill the data gap; however, large 433 uncertainties still remain in our datasets (e.g., N application rate within each country, annual 434 manure application amounts). More information is needed to improve these datasets in our 435 further work. 436





- 438 Acknowledgements: This study has been supported by National Key Research and
- 439 Development Program of China (no. 2017YFA0604702), NOAA Grants (NA16NOS4780207,
- 440 NA16NOS4780204), National Science Foundation (1210360, 1243232), STS Program of the
- 441 Chinese Academy of Sciences (KFJ-STS-ZDTP-010-05), SKLURE Grant (SKLURE2017-1-6).
- 442 We thank Dr. Wilfried Winiwarter in International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis for
- 443 constructive comments that have helped improve this study.





444	References
445	
446	Bouwman, A., Boumans, L., and Batjes, N.: Estimation of global NH ₃ volatilization loss from synthetic
447	fertilizers and animal manure applied to arable lands and grasslands, Global Biogeochemical Cycles,
448	16, 2002.
449	Bouwman, A., Beusen, A. H., and Billen, G.: Human alteration of the global nitrogen and phosphorus soil
450	balances for the period 1970–2050, Global Biogeochemical Cycles, 23, 2009.
451	Bouwman, A., Van Drecht, G., Knoop, J., Beusen, A., and Meinardi, C.: Exploring changes in river
452	nitrogen export to the world's oceans, Global Biogeochemical Cycles, 19, 2005.
453	Bouwman, L., Goldewijk, K. K., Van Der Hoek, K. W., Beusen, A. H., Van Vuuren, D. P., Willems, J.,
454	Rufino, M. C., and Stehfest, E.: Exploring global changes in nitrogen and phosphorus cycles in
455	agriculture induced by livestock production over the 1900–2050 period, Proceedings of the National
456	Academy of Sciences, 110, 20882-20887, 2013.
457	Breymeyer, A.: Managed grasslands and ecological experience, Ecosystems of the world, 17, 335-350,
458	1990.
459	Chang, J., Ciais, P., Herrero, M., Havlik, P., Campioli, M., Zhang, X., Bai, Y., Viovy, N., Joiner, J.,
460	Wang, X., Peng, S., Yue, C., Piao, S., Wang, T., Hauglustaine, D. A., Soussana, JF., Peregon, A.,
461	Kosykh, N., and Mironycheva-Tokareva, N.: Combining livestock production information in a
462	process-based vegetation model to reconstruct the history of grassland management, Biogeosciences,
463	13, 3757, 2016.
464	Cleveland, C. C., Townsend, A. R., Schimel, D. S., Fisher, H., Howarth, R. W., Hedin, L. O., Perakis, S.
465	S., Latty, E. F., Von Fischer, J. C., and Elseroad, A.: Global patterns of terrestrial biological nitrogen
466	(N ₂) fixation in natural ecosystems. Global Biogeochemical Cycles, 13, 623-645, 1999.
467	Dangal, S. R., Tian, H., Zhang, B., Pan, S., Lu, C., and Yang, J.: Methane emission from global livestock
468	sector during 1890–2014: Magnitude, trends and spatiotemporal patterns, Global Change Biology,
469	2017.
470	Davidson, E. A.: The contribution of manure and fertilizer nitrogen to atmospheric nitrous oxide since
471	1860. Nature Geoscience, 2, 659, 2009.
472	Davis, K. F., Yu, K., Herrero, M., Havlik, P., Carr, J. A., and D'Odorico, P.: Historical trade-offs of
473	livestock's environmental impacts. Environmental Research Letters, 10, 125013, 2015.
474	Evring, V., Lamarque, JF., Hess, P., Arfeuille, F., Bowman, K., Chipperfiel, M. P., Duncan, B., Fiore,
475	A., Gettelman, A., and Giorgetta, M. A.: Overview of IGAC/SPARC Chemistry-Climate Model
476	Initiative (CCMI) community simulations in support of upcoming ozone and climate assessments.
477	Sparc Newsletter, 40, 48-66, 2013.
478	FAOSTAT (Food and Agriculture Organization Corporate Statistical Database): FAO online database
479	available at: http://www.fao.org/faostat/en/#data (last access: July 2017). 2016
480	Galloway, J. N., Townsend, A. R., Erisman, J. W., Bekunda, M., Cai, Z., Freney, J. R., Martinelli, J. A.,
481	Seitzinger S P and Sutton M A · Transformation of the nitrogen cycle: recent trends questions
482	and potential solutions. Science, 320, 889-892, 2008
483	Gerber I S. Carlson K. M. Makowski, D. Mueller, N. D. Garcia de Cortazar-Atauri I. Havlík P.
484	Herrero M Lauray M O'Connell C S and Smith P Spatially explicit estimates of N ₂ O
485	emissions from cronlands suggest climate mitigation opportunities from improved fartilizer
486	management Global change biology 22 3383-3394 2016
400	Havlík P. Valin H. Herrero, M. Obersteiner, M. Schmid, F. Rufino, M. C. Mosnier, A. Thornton, P.
482	K Böttcher H and Conant R T · Climate change mitigation through livestock system transitions
489	Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 111 3709-3714 2014
405	Herrero M Havlík P Valin H Notenhaert A Rufino M C Thornton P K Rlümmel M Weiss
490 491	F Grace D and Obersteiner M · Riomass use production feed efficiencies and greenhouse gas
492	emissions from global livestock systems. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 110
492	20888-20893 2013
-JJ	20000 20075, 2015.

Science Scienc



- Holland, E., Lee-Taylor, J., Nevison, C., and Sulzman, J.: Global N Cycle: Fluxes and N₂O Mixing Ratios
 Originating from Human Activity. Data Set (Oak Ridge National Laboratory Distributed Active
 Archive Center, Oak Ridge, TN, 2005).
- Goldewijk, K. K., Beusen, A., Doelman, J., and Stehfest, E.: Anthropogenic land use estimates for the
 Holocene–HYDE 3.2, Earth System Science Data, 9, 927, 2017.
- Lassaletta, L., Billen, G., Grizzetti, B., Anglade, J., and Garnier, J.: 50 year trends in nitrogen use
 efficiency of world cropping systems: the relationship between yield and nitrogen input to cropland,
 Environmental Research Letters, 9, 105011, 2014.
- Liu, J., You, L., Amini, M., Obersteiner, M., Herrero, M., Zehnder, A. J., and Yang, H.: A high-resolution
 assessment on global nitrogen flows in cropland, Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences,
 107, 8035-8040, 2010.
- Lu, C. and Tian, H.: Global nitrogen and phosphorus fertilizer use for agriculture production in the past
 half century: shifted hot spots and nutrient imbalance, Earth System Science Data, 9, 181, 2017.
- Mueller, N. D., Gerber, J. S., Johnston, M., Ray, D. K., Ramankutty, N., and Foley, J. A.: Closing yield
 gaps through nutrient and water management, Nature, 490, 254, 2012.
- Nishina, K., Ito, A., Hanasaki, N., and Hayashi, S.: Reconstruction of spatially detailed global map of
 NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ application in synthetic nitrogen fertilizer, Earth System Science Data, 9, 149, 2017.
- Oenema, O., Wrage, N., Velthof, G. L., van Groenigen, J. W., Dolfing, J., and Kuikman, P. J.: Trends in
 global nitrous oxide emissions from animal production systems, Nutrient cycling in agroecosystems,
 72, 51-65, 2005.
- Potter, P., Ramankutty, N., Bennett, E. M., and Donner, S. D.: Characterizing the spatial patterns of
 global fertilizer application and manure production, Earth Interactions, 14, 1-22, 2010.
- Sattari, S., Bouwman, A., Rodríguez, R. M., Beusen, A., and Van Ittersum, M.: Negative global
 phosphorus budgets challenge sustainable intensification of grasslands, Nature communications, 7,
 10696, 2016.
- Sheldrick, W. F., Syers, J. K., and Lingard, J.: A conceptual model for conducting nutrient audits at
 national, regional, and global scales, Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems, 62, 61-72, 2002.
- Stehfest, E. and Bouwman, L.: N₂O and NO emission from agricultural fields and soils under natural
 vegetation: summarizing available measurement data and modeling of global annual emissions,
 Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems, 74, 207-228, 2006.
- Tian, H., Lu, C., Ciais, P., Michalak, A. M., Canadell, J. G., Saikawa, E., Huntzinger, D. N., Gurney, K.
 R., Sitch, S., and Zhang, B., Yang, J., Bousquet, P., Bruhwiler, L., Chen, G., Dlugokencky, E.,
 Friedlingstein, P., Melillo, J., Pan, S., Poulter, B., Prinn, R., Saunois, M., Schwalm, C. R., and Wofsy,
 S. C.: The terrestrial biosphere as a net source of greenhouse gases to the atmosphere, Nature, 531,
- **528** 225–228, 2016.
- Tian, H., Yang, J., Lu, C., Xu, R., Canadell, J. G., Jackson, R., Arneth, A., Chang, J., Chen, G., and Ciais,
 P.: The global N₂O Model Intercomparison Project (NMIP), Bulletin of the American Meteorological
 Society, 2018. <u>https://doi.org/10.1175/BAMS-D-17-0212.1</u>
- Tubiello, F. N., Salvatore, M., Rossi, S., Ferrara, A., Fitton, N., and Smith, P.: The FAOSTAT database
 of greenhouse gas emissions from agriculture, Environmental Research Letters, 8, 015009, 2013.
- Valin, H., Havlik, P., Mosnier, A., Herrero, M., Schmid, E., and Obersteiner, M.: Agricultural
 productivity and greenhouse gas emissions: trade-offs or synergies between mitigation and food
 security?, Environmental Research Letters, 8, 035019, 2013.
- Vitousek, P. M., Menge, D. N., Reed, S. C., and Cleveland, C. C.: Biological nitrogen fixation: rates,
 patterns and ecological controls in terrestrial ecosystems, Philosophical Transactions of the Royal
 Society of London B: Biological Sciences, 368, 20130119, 2013.
- White, R. P., Murray, S., Rohweder, M., Prince, S., and Thompson, K.: Grassland ecosystems, World
 Resources Institute Washington, DC, 2000.
- 542 Xu, R., Tian, H., Lu, C., Pan, S., Chen, J., Yang, J., and Bowen, Z.: Preindustrial nitrous oxide emissions
 543 from the land biosphere estimated by using a global biogeochemistry model, Climate of the Past, 13,
 544 977, 2017.





- 545 Xu, R., Pan, S., Chen, J., Chen, G., Yang, J., Dangal, S., Shepard, J., and Tian, H.: Half-Century
- Ammonia Emissions From Agricultural Systems in Southern Asia: Magnitude, Spatiotemporal
 Patterns, and Implications for Human Health, GeoHealth, 2, 40-53, 2018.
- 548 Zhang, B., Tian, H., Lu, C., Dangal, S. R., Yang, J., and Pan, S.: Global manure nitrogen production and
- application in cropland during 1860–2014: a 5 arcmin gridded global dataset for Earth system
 modeling, Earth System Science Data, 9, 667-678, 2017.
- 551





552	Table 1. The N input rates, applied/deposited area, and total amounts in global grasslands (pastures and
553	rangelands) in 1860, 1961, 2000, and 2014 (1 km ² = 100 ha).

	1860	1961	1980	2000	2014
Averaged N fertilizer application rate (kg N ha ⁻¹ yr ⁻¹)	NA	0.07	3.68	7.79	10.67
Total applied area (Mha)	NA	623.83	724.98	797.80	797.36
Total amounts (Tg N yr ⁻¹)	NA	0.05	2.67	6.21	8.50
Average manure N application rate (kg N ha ⁻¹ yr ⁻¹)	5.30	8.06	9.83	9.53	10.72
Total applied area (Mha)	268.21	623.83	725.0	797.80	797.36
Total amounts (Tg N yr ⁻¹)	1.42	5.03	7.13	7.61	8.55
Average manure N deposition rate (kg N ha ⁻¹ yr ⁻¹)	11.27	16.09	19.76	21.45	26.3
Total deposited area (Mha)	1250.13	3070.65	3194.23	3398.45	3300.05
Total amounts (Tg N yr ⁻¹)	14.09	49.40	63.13	72.90	86.78





555	Table 2. Comparison of manure and fertilizer N application amounts between this study and published
556	datasets.

	Bouwman et al., $(2002)^{\alpha}$	Stehfest & Bouwman, 2006 ^β	Bouwman et al., 2013 ^γ	Chang et al., 2016^{α}	Liu et al., 2010 ^γ	Lassaletta et al., 2014 $^{\gamma}$	This study ^γ	
Manure N application (Tg N yr ⁻¹)	12.4	4.8	57.8	12.4	~2.8	NA	7.6	
Applied area (Mha)	625	NA	3358 ^η	1231	NA	NA	798	
N fertilizer application (Tg N yr ⁻¹)	4.3	3.1	NA	3.1	12.9	6.5	6.3	
Applied area (Mha)	103	NA	NA	39	NA	NA	798	

557 $^{\alpha}$ estimated in 1995.

^β national-level fertilizer data for 1998. The total grassland area for N fertilizer and manure was
 677 Mha.

560 γ estimated in 2000.

561 $^{\eta}$ the grassland area includes both mixed and patrol systems.







563

564 Figure 1. Diagram of the workflow for developing the database of global annual N fertilizer use

rate in pasture during the period 1961–2014.







567

- 568 Figure 2. Diagram of the workflow for developing the database of global annual manure N use rate in pasture and manure N
- 569 deposition rate in grassland during the period 1860–2014.

570







571

Figure 3. Temporal patterns of global manure N use, N fertilizer use, and manure deposition in grassland systems: (a) Manure N use and N fertilizer use on global pastures during 1860–2014
and during 1961–2014, respectively; (b) Manure N deposition to global grasslands during 1860–2014.







577

Figure 4. Spatial patterns of N input rates in global grassland systems in 1860, 1961, and 2014: (a)–(c) N fertilizer application rates;
 (d)–(f) manure N application rates; (g)–(i) manure N deposition rates.







580

Figure 5. Nitrogen fertilizer use, manure N use, and manure N deposition at regional scales in

1860s, 1960s, 1980s, and 2000–2014. Error bars represent standard deviation within each decade.

583

584

585