Interactive comment

Interactive comment on "Digital map of the Coral Triangle: An online atlas for marine biodiversity conservation" by Irawan Asaad et al.

S. Pittman (Referee)

sjpittman@gmail.com

Received and published: 10 September 2018

This paper describes the data sets, post-processing of data, synthesis data and interactive tools for an online atlas of the Coral Triangle region. The manuscript is well written with just a few typographic and grammatical errors (e.g., tenses, plurals). The digital product will be useful to conservation and marine management by greatly improving access to a wide range of data that can support decision making in spatial planning and conservation prioritization. You mention it a little in the Discussion but it should be first set up in the Introduction section. Lastly, the conclusion section should be strengthened to include any limitations identified, major data gaps, next steps and ideas for how the data set and the tool can be applied and improved? Any additional functionality that would be useful?

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



My comments to help the authors revise the manuscript are below:

1. The Introduction section provides a good generic introduction to online databases and web maps but would benefit from a little more detail on the threats and conservation efforts in the Coral Triangle region that need better spatial data. Who exactly would benefit and why? Outline specific examples where this online map product will enhance decision making in the region? For example, in Line 189-192 of the Discussion you mention the importance of spatial prioritization and 'enable an efficient decision-making process'. It would be good if you introduce these projects and processes in the Introduction.

Table 1 was repeated again on pages 19-22 in my version of the PDF.

2. Line 60-61 - typo 3. Line 75 - typo with tense 'develop' should be 'developed' and 'geo-reference' should be 'geo-referenced' 4. Line 79 - typo 'and and' 5. Line 84 - ArcGIS Pro 2.0 was instead of 'The ArcGIS Pro 2.0 were 6. Line 85 - and design three instead of 'designed these three' 7. Line 86 - was used instead of 'were used' 8. Line 87 - computer or other electronic device connected to (no need for plurals) 9. Line 88 - hosted by ArcGIS Online not 'by the ArcGIS Online' 10. Line 95 - refer to Table 1 at the end of each bullet point where appropriate 11. Line 96-97 - Briefly mention how these layers were defined and provide citations 12. Line 98 - Briefly mention how these layers were defined and provide citations 13. Line 106 - The Table 1 has been referred to as 5.1 and occasionally a chapter has been referred to so please revise throughout to be consistent for this manuscript. Same for your figure numbers. It sounds like this manuscript was originally written as a chapter 14. Line 110 - see comment above 15. Line 110-111 - provide URL for documentation if available online 16. Table 2 - I don't think you need to show the widgets. These are generic to ESRI app developer and do not provide useful information. It is something that you expect to see in a user manual.

17. In your description of methods there is no mention of uncertainty or error in your datasets. The metadata should include information to allow the user to assess uncer-

ESSDD

Interactive comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



tainty. You should also provide discussion on this issue and on any perceived scale (temporal and spatial) limitations of the data in this manuscript. 18. Line 188 - to develop geospatial tools to support instead of 'and develop a geospatial tool' 19. Line 206 - typo - remove 'and' after 'provided' 20. Line 213 - typo - remove 'areas' before 'priority' 21. Line 217 - remove 'this' before 'digital maps' 22. 229-238 - The conclusion is basically just a repetition of the same information in the manuscript. It would be more useful for you to think about future applications (e.g., modelling biological distributions, predicting spatial change, mapping vulnerability to threats, spatial resilience) and improvements to tool functionality.

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2018-80, 2018.

ESSDD

Interactive comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

