

Referee review for essd-2018-3

Overall, this is a great study, very detailed and sophisticated. Thanks for such a good work. This data can be used for many advanced research and publications. Recommended to be published in ESDD after few, but not major clarifications.

In the line 27th, it is stated that “Kazakhstan is included in the data set as a member of Annex I countries for the purpose of the Kyoto Protocol”. What does this mean? Kazakhstan is considered as Annex-I because it ratified the Kyoto Protocol? If this is the reason, many other non-Annex I countries ratified Kyoto Protocol as well. Why only including Kazakhstan? Could you please clarify this little bit more?

Also, in the following sentence it is stated that Malta and Cyprus are reporting their emissions as members of European Union. Can you provide some reference for this, where do you get such information?

Lastly, at the data description file on page 2, it is stated there are 3 .csv files in the date sets. However, there are only 2 csv files in addition to two other text files. The following file is not there: “PRIMAP-crf-IPCC2006-category-codes.csv” Could you please include this file as well.

Please also check the correction of the measurements, there are several variables/units, a mistake easily can be made. Since I am not able to go over each calculation in details, I can only suggest you making sure that there is no mistake in the calculations.

After these corrections and clarifications, I recommend the study to be published in ESDD.