

Interactive comment on “EDGAR v4.3.2 Global Atlas of the three major Greenhouse Gas Emissions for the period 1970–2012” by Greet Janssens-Maenhout et al.

Carlson (Referee)

ipy.djc@gmail.com

Received and published: 31 January 2019

Thank the authors for substantial and extensive changes in the present version compared to the first submission. The description now seems more accurate, less promotional, more carefully documented, with fewer loose ends, and overall more useful. The ‘strengths and weaknesses’ section proves very helpful as does the evaluation and limitations section. Because these sections show the authors’ approach and knowledge of the subject, they substantially strengthen the overall presentation.

The authors point out in several places their inability to evaluate uncertainty of source information. Eventually, perhaps through the CHE or VERIFY projects as described, an

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



integrated uncertainty assessment will prove necessary. For now, in this description, these authors have provided a much clearer guide to and recognition of residual and on-going uncertainty issues.

A few small technical points:

Page 3: text and footnote confusion and omissions at the bottom of page 3 continuing into Page 4. Please revise. Similar problem at the bottom of Page 4.

Page 7 line 29 and following: “We do not recommend an uncertainty analysis of the proxy data itself, but a sensitivity assessment of the representativeness of the selected proxy data using. This needs atmospheric transport modeling and is taken up in the CHE project.” Some text missing here? Reader first encounters the CHE acronym here, needs more information about the CHE project, not defined and explained until Page 8.

Also places in the supplement, e.g. Page 15 line 21, where, because supplement now contains text cut from the main narrative and pasted here, the supplement refers to itself?

Authors will need to provide multiple eyes and careful attention to acronyms, references, footnotes, etc. during typesetting and proofreading stages.

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2018-164>, 2019.

[Printer-friendly version](#)[Discussion paper](#)