Interactive comment on “A database of marine and terrestrial radiogenic Nd and Sr isotopes for tracing earth-surface processes” by Cécile L. Blanchet

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 25 March 2019

Blanchet, 2018(9) laid out a database for Nd and Sr isotopic signature of marine and terrestrial archives for geochemical fingerprinting of earth-surface processes. One of the significance of this contribution is discussing the shortcomings of the available Nd-Sr datasets and addition of sample coordinates for easier graphical presentation of data on georeferenced maps. I found the manuscript fit for the publication in Earth System Science Data Discussion, with the following revisions: Major Comments: The title of the manuscript, as well as the GFZ data management service at http://doi.org/10.5880/GFZ.5.2.2018.001 (Blanchet 2018c), imply that the author is presenting a global Nd-Sr dataset for marine and terrestrial archives. However, in the text (e.g. Page 3 Line 4 and Line 24) the criteria for the region revealed as Africa, Europe,
Mediterranean, and Atlantic. I highly recommend modifying the title so one can clearly relate to the dataset presented in the manuscript. Although the author stated that the criteria for the regions in the dataset set for Africa, Europe, Mediterranean, and Atlantic but Table 4 and Figure 1 contain samples from Indian Ocean, Asia and Caspian Sea. If this dataset meant to represent the Nd-Sr isotopic signature of marine and terrestrial samples in a global scales then it should contain other well-established records from the Middle East, Atlantic, Arctic, Asia, Australia, and Antarctica, see the list below for example. If the author, at this stage, is mainly focused on Mediterranean, Africa and Europe regions then she needs to elaborate more on the rationale behind selecting these regions.


Minor Comments â€˜Page 1, Line 19: add a parenthesis before “Region”. â€˜Page 2, Line 15: “… important recent additions” from which region? â€˜Page 3, Line 11: Please add citation after ”143Nd/144Nd ratio of 0.512638”: … chondritic uniform reservoir and has a 143Nd/144Nd ratio of 0.512638 (Bouvier et al., 2008). Bouvier, A., Vervoort, J.D., Patchett, P.J., 2008. The Lu–Hf and Sm–Nd isotopic com-position of CHUR: Constraints from unequilibrated chondrites and implications for the bulk composition of terrestrial planets. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.273, 48–57. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2008.06.010. â€˜Page 3, Line 28, Page 6, Line 24, Table 4, Figure 1 and Figure 3: Change bivalve to freshwater Mollusk as defined by Osborn et al. (2008).