

Interactive comment on “Rainfall simulation experiments in the Southwestern USA using the Walnut Gulch Rainfall Simulator” by Viktor Polyakov et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 27 September 2017

This data paper presents a database of 272 rainfall simulations on different locations (some were repeated at different time on the same location). Available data includes information on the experimental conditions (amount of precipitation), description of the plot, and information about erosion and infiltration. This dataset represents more than ten years of a massive work and should be of great interest to understand erosion and to calibrate numerical model of erosion.

I recommend this paper for publication. However, I think some improvements could be done :

- I found Section 2 hard to read. Maybe more information should be displayed in C1

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



Table 1 and the comments should be more general on sites than describing one site after another.

- In order to help a potential user of data, Table 2 should be described in the text. I am not sure to understand why in some cases there are N/A. It should be explained. Moreover, in this table data on experimental condition should be distinguished with measurements (e.g. precipitation and run-on columns should be distinguish with runoff discharge, sediment concentration... columns).
- the paper would be more interesting if all the figures were commented in the text.
- typo ? line 211 table X ??

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2017-81>, 2017.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

