

Interactive comment on “Manure nitrogen production and application in cropland and rangeland during 1860–2014: A 5-minute gridded global data set for Earth system modeling” by Bowen Zhang et al.

D. J. Carlson (Editor)

ipy.djc@gmail.com

Received and published: 17 May 2017

We have a careful review for this data set - many thanks to reviewer 1.

We have a second review ready, but that review references unpublished (e.g. confidential) material from another journal. We will close this discussion, add that second review, and ask authors to respond. Once the information contained in the second review becomes open (published), we will re-open this entire discussion for inclusion with the manuscript.

I appreciate cooperation of publisher, authors and reviewers as we manage these dif-

C1

ferent policies among journals.

Dave Carlson

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., doi:10.5194/essd-2017-11, 2017.