

Final author comments to referee 1 comments on “A high space-time resolution dataset linking meteorological forcing and hydro-sedimentary response in a mesoscale Mediterranean catchment (Auzon) of the Ardèche region, France” by Nord et al.

In the following, the reviewer comments appear in black italic and our answers are provided in blue. When there are quotations from the text of the article, they appear in quotation marks and the new or corrected parts are highlighted in yellow.

essd-2016-32-RC2.pdf

*Another thing that needs to be discussed is the policy for data access and data re-use. Concerning access, I already expressed some concerns. More specifically, it needs to be made clear how datasets are *accessible* and under what conditions the data can be *reused*: access: * truly public (ie. directly accessible) * after registration * with additional costs (i.e. cannot be part of this publication) reuse: * free (i.e. Public Domain, Creative Commons or similar) * additional restrictions Specifically, I would like to discuss the implications of the HYMEX data policy C1(http://mistrals.sedoo.fr/HyMeX/Data-Policy/HyMeX_DataPolicy.pdf), which seems to govern the largest part of the data.*

Answer: See above the response to comment 9 (in the response to [essd-2016-32-RC1.pdf](#)).

As stated above, the data under public status are not subject to the HyMeX data policy which applies only to data under "associated scientists" or "core users" status. The data under public status represent the majority of the data associated with this paper. Most of these data are bundled in the "zip1_auzon.zip" file and are directly accessible to a ftp without any step of identification.

On the other hand, all the individual datasets under public status are accessible independently via the links indicated in Tables 5 and 6. It is true that there is an authentication step for the individual datasets stored in the HyMeX database but the access is immediate and free after the creation of an account. The step of creation of this account has been modified to comply with basic rules of ethics.

For individual datasets under the "associated scientists" status of the HyMeX data policy, the rules for accessing and using these data (http://mistrals.sedoo.fr/HyMeX/Data-Policy/HyMeX_DataPolicy.pdf) must be accepted by the future user of the data during the step of creation of an account in the database HyMeX (<http://mistrals.sedoo.fr/User-Account-Creation/>). For more transparency, the evaluation process of the new account is now explained in the web page of the form for the account creation. The data remain free but are subject to constraints explained in the data policy. These constraints are common for data of this type which are usually marketed by Météo France.

a) Section 3 §4 states that data can be made public domain. However, imposing additional obligations (section 4) contradicts to the common notion of PD as being completely free. b) Section 4 §2 restricts the use of the data to objectives of the HYMEX programme. c) While the correct attribution of the data being used of course is scientific best practice (section 4, §5), the license also

requires to offer collaboration to the PI (§6) and co-authorship (§7). d) Derived data and publications need to be provided to HYMEX (§11-13). In my opinion,

a) needs clarification.

Answer: We think we have made clarifications with the answer to comment 9 (in the response to [essd-2016-32-RC1.pdf](#)) and the additional answer just above.

b) likely restricts the use for some scientific research questions and should be removed.

Answer: This constraint applies only to individual datasets under the "associated scientists" status of the HyMeX data policy (9 of 41 individual datasets in this study), the other individual datasets under public status are not subject to it (32 of 41 in this study). We are aware that this constraint limits the scope of the individual datasets under the "associated scientists" status. We have ensured that a maximum number of individual datasets are under the public status. However some datasets remain under this status despite our efforts. It will not be possible to amend the data policy.

c) with §6 and §7 is ethically undue. The authors of the data have already claimed their academic rewards by (then) having published the ESSD-paper and it being cited in case of re-use. While any researcher may be happy to contact the PI and invite him to collaborate, it cannot be mandatory.

Answer: We recognize this may be a problem, we have done our utmost to ensure that it covers a limited number of individual datasets (only the individual datasets under the "associated status" of the HyMeX data policy). However, we consider that the individual datasets concerned are important to integrate into the study.

d) loosely corresponds to a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International (CC BY-NC 4.0), which is acceptable.

Answer: Again, this constraint applies only to individual datasets under the "associated scientists" status of the HyMeX data policy (9 of 41 in this study), the other individual datasets under public status are not subject to it (32 of 41 in this study).

These are, of course, ethical decisions and thus open to debate. The requirements of ESSD are quite diffuse about that (data needs to be "openly accessible (cost-free for readers)"). I specifically ask the other reviewers and the editor to express their opinion on these points.

Answer: We had already exchanged a lot on this subject with the editors before submitting the paper. We have tried to take into account their remarks as well as those of the reviewers as best we could.