Open Access

Earth System
Science
Data

Discussions

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on "Measurement of fracture toughness of an ice core from Antarctica" *by* J. Christmann et al.

D. J. Carlson (Editor)

ipy.djc@gmail.com

Received and published: 18 March 2015

This manuscript presents a difficult editorial decision. On the one hand the authors have made all of this data available and provided a very adequate description (as both reviewers seem to agree). The authors have also responded extensively and for the most part comprehensively to reviewer comments. Difficulties to find reviewers for this topic indicate that we need to credit those reviewers who did offer their expertise. On the first round, neither reviewer showed great enthusiasm for the data or its presentation but both indicated usefulness.

After revision, one reviewer remains dissatisfied. The remaining concern seems to center on comparison of the present data to prior data (Rist 1999). Unfortunately the

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

remaining dispute confuses technical issues - of the interpretation of the data itself - with responsiveness issues - have the authors responded sufficiently and honestly?

The manuscript as I read it does seem to provide sufficient response. About the technical issues I can not judge but I believe making the data and the reviews available will allow others to make their own judgements.

Fundamentally, I come back to the original assessments of both reviewers - acceptable with some improvements. Unusual data, with not many comparison data available, but openly shared. Accepting that a technical dispute remains, I can not otherwise find a clear reason requiring rejection.

———————————————

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., 7, 611, 2014.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper