

Interactive comment on “Nordic Seas nutrients data in CARINA” by J. Olafsson and A. Olsen

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 18 May 2010

I recommend the paper for the publication pending minor corrections.

Line 13: It's not completely true to tell, that the 188 cruises were previously not available publicly. At least part of these data (e.g. T & S) have been available. This is probably not true for CARBON specific parameters.

Lines 55-56. I suggest to insert here just a couple of sentences explaining which procedures belong to the primary QC and what is the essence of the secondary QC.

Line 72: calculated carbon parametrs. It's probably better to say “carbon-related” parameters. (pH, for instance, does not “contain” any carbon)

Line 79: change “describes the secondary QC” to “describes only the secondary QC”. Please, explain why the primary QC is not described.

Line 89: “long term QC procedures” - please, explain, what is meant here.

C30

Line 123-124: I suggest to change “using a k-means clustering routine” to “a clustering routine”. Otherwise, an explanation of what “k-means” mean is required, as not everyone might know about this specific routine.

Line 132: “the offsets and uncertainties” - the “d” by “and” is missing

Line 161: please be more specific in what range of intercept values belongs to “mall and possibly slightly negative values”.

Lines 175-179. Please omit all cruise codes here, because they are listed again in the lines 183-184. The paragraph should be accordingly reformulated, so that just the numbers of cruises outside the 5% limits for each parameter should be given here.

Line 278: I think “nutrients data” should be replaced by “nutrient data”.

Line 284: “The inversion suggests” (s is missing)

Table 1: Line 406. I agree that the abbreviation “nuts” is understandable. Nevertheless, it is probably better not to use this slang.

Line 419 What are the 5-percent limits?

Lines 427, 432, 437: everywhere delete “drawn at”

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., 3, 55, 2010.

C31